

Mr. David Holland

20 September 2011

Dear Mr. Holland

**ENVIRONMENTAL INFORMATION REGULATIONS 2004 – INFORMATION
REQUEST (FOI_10-167; EIR_11-012)**

Your request for information received on 25 July 2011 as clarified on 11 August 2011 regarding information held by our institution as a result of the participation of our employees in the Second Lead Authors Meeting (LA2), 18-22 July 2011, at Brest, France has now been considered and some of the information requested is enclosed herewith. Please accept my apologies for the delay in forwarding this response to you.

For your convenience, we have reproduced your request in the attachment to this letter and provided our response in line with each question. Given the large amount of information involved, we have itemised the relevant material and provided a response for each document. For each document, there may be a variety of responses ranging from release of a document to citation of a webpage to the invocation of an exception. We trust this will be to your satisfaction.

In line with your email of 11 August 2011, we have removed material relating to travel arrangements, expenses and general logistics relating to the meeting from the scope of the request and have focussed on material dealing with the assessment process itself.

However, it is not possible to satisfy all elements of your request directly, and, in accordance with Regulation 14 of the Environmental Information Regulations 2004 this letter acts as a partial Refusal Notice. We are not obliged to supply this information and the reasons for exemption are as stated below:

Exception	Reason
Reg. 6(1)(b), Information available to requester	Some information is available on IPCC Secretariat and WG1 webpages
Reg. 12(3) & 13(1), Personal information	Release of some of the requested information would contravene the first data protection principle
Reg. 12(4)(d), Unfinished documents	Some requested information are drafts and therefore are unfinished documents

Reg. 12(5)(a), Adverse effect on international relations

Release of some information would adversely affect relations with the IPCC

Reg. 12(5)(f), Adverse effects on person providing information

Release of the requested information, would have an adverse effect on the persons providing the information

Exception explanation

There is a significant amount of information that was provided by the IPCC WG1 TSU to two of our employees as a result of their participation in the meeting in Brest which is available to yourself via other means, specifically via the websites of both the IPCC WG1 and the IPCC Secretariat. Where this is the case, we have so indicated in the list of relevant material.

With regard to our use of Regulation 13(1), we would hold that, firstly, the some of the requested information contains information that meets the definition of 'personal information' as defined by section 1(1) of the UK Data Protection Act 1998 (DPA). It is our belief that disclosure of this information would be contrary, at the very least, to the first data protection principle under the DPA; namely that information be processed in a fair and lawful fashion that also meets at least one of the conditions set out in Schedule 2 of the Act. We do not have consent for the release of this information, nor are there any conditions present that would allow us to release under any of the other provisions of Schedule 2 of the DPA. This applies, in particular, to the correspondence between Dr. Osborn and his co-authors who have not given their consent for release of their personal information.

We invoke Regulations 12(4)(d) in several instances where the information provided to, or exchanged by, our two participants consists of material in the course of completion or are unfinished documents. In particular, the material relating to the 'Zero Order Draft', is incomplete and/or an unfinished draft of a much larger work to be published in future; namely, the AR5 report itself.

In regards the correspondence and attachments to such correspondence, some of it quotes material that is within the Zero Order draft. Even where there is no direct quotation, the correspondence and emails certainly 'relate to' material in the course of completion or unfinished documents as the exchange of ideas is, in effect, the process of drafting the Zero Order draft. The emails themselves are the means by which the incomplete material comes into being, so the content of the emails themselves are also incomplete material (or assuredly relate to incomplete material).

Turning to Regulation 12(5)(a), we base this on representations received from the IPCC WG1 TSU itself in which it objected to the release of some of the requested information. Clearly the IPCC WG1 TSU is an international body as defined by the EIR and a number of UK-based academics are involved in the IPCC process. Release of some information in the face of the objections and representations provided to us by the IPCC WG1 TSU would, we believe, damage the ability of UK-based academics to fully participate in this significant global initiative. Indeed, the IPCC has published guidelines, available on the web, that explicitly provide for, and demand, confidentiality of some information and have been agreed to by many national governments. To release information intended to be confidential would have a significant negative impact on relations with the IPCC generally, not just for UEA-based academics, but for all UK-based academics as well, and would also fly in the face of the agreement between the member governments.

In regards the correspondence of Dr. Osborn the correspondents with which he communicated have indicated their lack of consent for the release of this information. Where we to release such information, it is clear that the willingness of academics within other nations to correspond openly with UK academics would be diminished and the interests of the UK thereby harmed.

Regulation 12(5)(f) is cited on the basis that the IPCC WG1 TSU has made representations to our institution regarding the release of some the requested information, claiming that the release of the information would adversely affect their interests. They have provided reasons for their position, and where cited, we have accepted those reasons and explanations as justifiable. To release such information would significantly damage the reputation of the IPCC and its ability to work with academics from all nations.

In regards the correspondence of Dr. Osborn, the correspondents with which he communicated have indicated their lack of consent for the release of this information. Such lack of consent is evidence of the perception of an adverse effect on the interests of the person providing the communication and we have therefore excepted this information.

Public interest

Pursuant to Regulation 12(1)(b), we must also apply a public interest test to any and all information excepted under Regulation 12 and this test must be applied as a whole to the entire request rather than exception by exception. It is our opinion that, in relation to the excepted material, the public interest lies in non-disclosure.

Where draft versions of material in the public domain have been requested, there is little public interest in the disclosure of earlier, unapproved versions of the same material. There is also a public interest in ensuring that the information available to the public has been properly reviewed and assessed as takes place in the academic publication process. This lessens the possibility that earlier, less well-examined versions of the information are released that do not, in fact, represent the fully considered views of the authors and/or contributors. Additionally, release of early drafts and preliminary information could inhibit the free and frank exchange of views required to produce such work.

With specific reference to the material covered by this request, we certainly acknowledge the public interest in the work of the IPCC. However the IPCC will, in 2013, publish a final version of the AR5 report and a substantial amount of interim material will be released concurrent with the publication of the final report. We feel that the publication of both the interim material and final report will meet the public interest in knowing of the development of, and end product of, the work of the IPCC, and that there is little to be added to the public understanding of, or participation in, the IPCC process by the publication of very preliminary information.

Additionally, the IPCC will be inviting concerned individuals to become external expert reviewers of the First Order Draft (FOD) which will provide an opportunity for the wider community to review and comment upon a draft of the work in progress.

In relation to material excepted by virtue of the adverse affect on the persons providing the information, in this case the IPCC, there is a public interest in preserving the ongoing good relationship between the UK academic sector and the IPCC in that it is to the public benefit that UK-based academics participate in fully such a global initiative of value. There is also value to the greater non-UK public in the full participation and contribution of UK-based academics in the IPCC assessment process.

Additionally, there is a public interest in preserving some private space within which academics can communicate freely and openly, exchange frank and robust views and work towards an agreed consensus that will be reflected in the published output of the IPCC process. This also allows for the development of material without the pressure of external and public discussion of every exchange in the drafting process.

The IPCC, in various public announcements, and in conversation with the participants within the IPCC process, has made assurances to participants regarding the confidentiality of certain work and communication. It would not be in the public interest to act contrary to these assurances and thereby reduce not only the reputation of the

IPCC, but also the ability of the organisation to attract, and work with, noted academics from around the world.

I would also add that any material released over which UEA has copyright is released subject to the understanding that you will comply with all relevant copyright rules regarding reproduction and/or transmission of the information released.

You have the right of appeal against this decision. If you wish to appeal, please set out in writing your grounds of appeal and send to me at:

University of East Anglia
Norwich
NR4 7TJ
Telephone: 01603 593 523
E-mail: foi@uea.ac.uk

You must appeal our decision within 60 calendar days of the date of this letter. Any appeal received after that date will not be considered nor acknowledged. This policy has been reviewed and approved by the Information Commissioner's Office.

You also have a subsequent right of appeal to the Information Commissioner at:

Information Commissioner's Office
Wycliffe House
Water Lane
Wilmslow, Cheshire
SK9 5AF
Telephone: 0303 123 1113
www.ico.gov.uk

Please quote our reference given at the head of this letter in all correspondence.

Yours sincerely

David Palmer
Information Policy and Compliance Manager
University of East Anglia

Response to Environmental Information Regulations request (FOI_11-167; EIR_11-12)

Request for information on Guidance to IPCC Lead Authors

In Appendix E (page 4 para 4) to your letter of 23 November 2010 (FOI_10-112; EIR_10-14) you wrote:

“Additionally, recent guidance given to IPCC lead authors has clearly indicated that communication between lead authors is to remain confidential, and that emails and preliminary versions of work are not made public, cited, quoted nor distributed.”

Please send me a copy of this guidance.

[Information excepted pursuant to Reg. 6(1)(b), Environmental Information Regulations]

This information is publicly available on the IPCC AR5 WG1 website as follows

Guidance notes to Holders of Functions and Offices in IPCC Working Group I

<http://www.ipcc.unibe.ch/guidancepaper/guidancenotes.html>

and guidance papers for the Lead Authors of the IPCC Assessment Reports are here:

<http://www.ipcc.unibe.ch/guidancepaper/guidancepaper.html>

I note that your Timothy Osborn is a lead author on the ongoing IPCC Fifth Assessment Report AR5 process and I presume recently attended the first Lead Author Meeting in China from 8 to 11 of this month.

Please send me copies of all the documents he received in preparation for and resulting from that meeting, pertaining to the IPCC and the Assessment process. I am not interested in domestic correspondence concerning travel and accommodation, although I do consider any reimbursements arrangements relevant.

1. Correspondence to and from Dr. Tim Osborn and Prof. Corrine Le Quere

1) Osborn correspondence

[Information excepted pursuant to Reg. 12(3) & 13(1), 12(4)(d), Reg. 12(5)(a) & Reg. 12(5)(f), Environmental Information Regulations]

There are eleven (11) pieces of correspondence to and from Dr. Osborn that are relevant to this request. All are excepted from disclosure pursuant to the above-noted regulations.

2) Le Quere correspondence

[Information excepted pursuant to Reg. 12(3) & 13(1), & 12(4)(d), Environmental Information Regulations]

There are fourteen (14) pieces of correspondence to and from Prof. Le Quere that are relevant to this request. All are excepted from disclosure pursuant to the above-noted regulations.

2. Attachments to correspondence to and from Dr. Tim Osborn & Prof. Corinne Le Quere

1) Osborn attachments

[Information excepted pursuant to Reg. 12(3) & 13(1), 12(4)(d), Reg. 12(5)(a) & Reg. 12(5)(f), Environmental Information Regulations]

There are ten (10) attachments to correspondence to and from Dr. Osborn that are relevant to this request. All are excepted from disclosure pursuant to the above-noted regulations.

2) Le Quere attachments

[Information excepted pursuant to Reg. 12(3) & 13(1), & 12(4)(d), Environmental Information Regulations]

There are five (5) attachments to correspondence to and from Prof. Le Quere that are relevant to this request. All are excepted from disclosure pursuant to the above-noted regulations.

3. Meeting materials provided to participants (print booklet)

1) Title page

2) Table of Contents

3) Welcome and introduction

The above three (3) documents are in the file 'Introductory materials.pdf' within the attached .zip file, Appendix A_IPCC documentation

4) Programme

The above-noted document is within the attached .zip file, Appendix A_IPCC documentation

5) ZOD Information

[Information excepted pursuant to Reg. 12(4)(d), 12(5)(a) & 12(5)(f), Environmental Information Regulations]

6) Chapter Information

a. Expanded Timetable for the Implementation of the Working Group 1 Contribution to the Fifth Assessment Report

Document is within attached .zip file, Appendix A_IPCC documentation

b. Working Group 1 Contribution to the IPCC Fifth Assessment Report – Climate Change 2013: The Physical Science Basis. Coordinating Lead Authors, Lead Authors and Review Editors

[Information excepted pursuant to Reg. 6(1)(b), Environmental Information Regulations]

The above-noted documents are on the IPCC WG1 website at <http://www.ipcc.unibe.ch/AR5/AR5.html>

7) Glossary Development

a. IPCC WG1 AR4 Glossary

[Information excepted pursuant to Reg. 6(1)(b), Environmental Information Regulations]

The above-noted document is on the IPCC WG1 website at <http://www.ipcc-wg1.unibe.ch/publications/wg1-ar4/wg1-ar4.html>

b. IPCC Special Report on Managing the Risks of Extreme Events and Disasters to Advance Climate Change Adaptation – Final Draft Glossary

***[Information excepted pursuant to Reg. 12(4)(d), Reg. 12(5)(a) & Reg. 12(5)(f),
Environmental Information Regulations]***

8) Provisional list of participants

The above-noted document is within the attached .zip file, Appendix A_IPCC documentation

4. Memory stick provided to all participants¹

1) AR4

- a. IPCC_AR4_SyR_Appendix_FINAL.pdf
- b. IPCC_AR4_SyR_FINAL.pdf
- c. IPCC_AR4_SyR_SPM_FINAL.pdf
- d. IPCC_AR4_UncertaintyGuidanceNote.pdf
- e. IPCC_AR4_WG1_Annexes_FINAL.pdf
- f. IPCC_AR4_WG1_AnnexI_FINAL.pdf
- g. IPCC_AR4_WG1_AnnexII_FINAL.pdf
- h. IPCC_AR4_WG1_AnnexIII_FINAL.pdf
- i. IPCC_AR4_WG1_Ch01_FINAL.pdf
- j. IPCC_AR4_WG1_Ch02_FINAL.pdf
- k. IPCC_AR4_WG1_Ch03_FINAL.pdf
- l. IPCC_AR4_WG1_Ch03-SM_FINAL.pdf
- m. IPCC_AR4_WG1_Ch04_FINAL.pdf
- n. IPCC_AR4_WG1_Ch05_FINAL.pdf
- o. IPCC_AR4_WG1_Ch06_FINAL.pdf
- p. IPCC_AR4_WG1_Ch06-SM_FINAL.pdf
- q. IPCC_AR4_WG1_Ch07_FINAL.pdf
- r. IPCC_AR4_WG1_Ch08_FINAL.pdf
- s. IPCC_AR4_WG1_Ch08-SM_FINAL.pdf
- t. IPCC_AR4_WG1_Ch09_FINAL.pdf
- u. IPCC_AR4_WG1_Ch09-SM_FINAL.pdf
- v. IPCC_AR4_WG1_Ch10_FINAL.pdf
- w. IPCC_AR4_WG1_Ch10-SM_FINAL.pdf
- x. IPCC_AR4_WG1_Ch11_FINAL.pdf
- y. IPCC_AR4_WG1_Ch11-SM_FINAL.pdf
- z. IPCC_AR4_WG1_Errata_FINAL.pdf
- aa. IPCC_AR4_WG1_FAQs_FINAL.pdf
- bb. IPCC_AR4_WG1_FrontMatter_FINAL.pdf
- cc. IPCC_AR4_WG1_Index_FINAL.pdf

¹ Each number section represents a 'folder' within the memory stick given to all participants that may have sub-folders. Actual documents are itemised and listed

- dd. IPCC_AR4_WG1 _SPM _FINAL.pdf
- ee. IPCC_AR4_WG1 _SummaryVolume_Errata _FINAL.pdf
- ff. IPCC_AR4_WG1 _TS _FINAL.pdf
- gg. IPCC_AR4_WGII _SPM_FINAL.pdf
- hh. IPCC_AR4_WGIII _SPM_FINAL.pdf
- ii. IPCC_AR4_WGIII _xErrata_FINAL.pdf

[Information excepted pursuant to Reg. 6(1)(b), Environmental Information Regulations]

All the above-noted documents are on the IPCC WG1 website at <http://www.ipcc.unibe.ch> or on the IPCC website itself at <http://www.ipcc.ch>

2) Background information

- a. 01-Scoping Meeting (Venice_Jul09)
 - i. AR5-SCOP_doc2_PachauriVisionPaper.pdf
 - ii. AR5-SCOP_inf11 _GovenmentComments.pdf
 - iii. AR5-SCOP_doc2_MeetingReport.pdf

[Information excepted pursuant to Reg. 6(1)(b), Environmental Information Regulations]

All the above-noted documents are on the IPCC website itself at <http://www.ipcc.ch> within the 'Meeting Documentation' section

- b. 02_B-40 (Geneva_Sep09)
 - i. ScopingMeetingReport_GovernmentComments_wg1.xml

[Information excepted pursuant to Reg. 12(5)(a) & (f), Environmental Information Regulations]

- c. 03-WGI-11 (Bali_Oct09)
 - i. wg1-11doc2_ChapterOutline.pdf
 - ii. wg1-11doc3_ImplementationPlan.pdf
 - iii. wg1-11inf1_Backgroundinformation.pdf

[Information excepted pursuant to Reg. 6(1)(b), Environmental Information Regulations]

All the above-noted documents are on the IPCC website itself at <http://www.ipcc.ch> within the 'Meeting Documentation' section

- d. 04_P-31 (Bali_Oct09)
 - i. p31doc4_AR5-Scoping.pdf
 - ii. p31doc19_wg1ChapterOutline.pdf
 - iii. p31inf5_GovernmentComments.pdf

[Information excepted pursuant to Reg. 6(1)(b), Environmental Information Regulations]

All the above-noted documents are on the IPCC website itself at <http://www.ipcc.ch> within the 'Meeting Documentation' section

e. WG1AR5_ChapterOutlineDevelopment.pdf

[Information excepted pursuant to Reg. 12(4)(d), 12(5)(a) & 12(5)(f), Environmental Information Regulations]

f. WG1AR5Poster.pdf

[Information excepted pursuant to Reg. 12(4)(d), 12(5)(a) & 12(5)(f), Environmental Information Regulations]

3) General Chapter Information

a. WG1AR5_ChapterOutline.pdf

b. WG1AR5_ChapterTeams.pdf

[Information excepted pursuant to Reg. 6(1)(b), Environmental Information Regulations]

Both the above-noted documents are on the IPCC WG1 website at

<http://www.ipcc.unibe.ch/AR5/AR5.html>

c. WG1AR5_ExpandedTimetable.pdf

Document is within attached .zip file, Appendix A_IPCC documentation

4) Glossary Development

a. WG1AR5_ZOD-Glossary_AR4input.pdf

[Information excepted pursuant to Reg. 6(1)(b), Environmental Information Regulations]

The above-noted document is on the IPCC WG1 website at <http://www.ipcc-wg1.unibe.ch/publications/wg1-ar4/wg1-ar4.html>

b. WG1AR5_ZOD-Glossary_SREXch03input.pdf

[Information excepted pursuant to Reg. 12(4)(d), Reg. 12(5)(a) & Reg. 12(5)(f), Environmental Information Regulations]

5) Good Practice Guidance Papers

a. D&A_GoodPracticeGuidancePaper.pdf

b. MME_GoodPracticeGuidancePaper.pdf

[Information excepted pursuant to Reg. 6(1)(b), Environmental Information Regulations]

Both the above-noted documents are on the IPCC WG1 website at

<http://www.ipcc.unibe.ch/publications/supportingmaterial/supportingmaterial.html>

6) Guidance Notes

a. AR5GuidanceNotes_Literature.pdf

b. AR5GuidanceNotes_Uncertainty.pdf

c. AR5GuidanceNotes_Uncertainty-Annexes.pdf

d. WG1_GuidanceNote_Confidentiality.pdf

e. WG1_GuidanceNote_Conflict-of-Interest.pdf

f. WG1_GuidanceNote_MediaPublicCommunication.pdf

g. WG1_Methodology.pdf

[Information excepted pursuant to Reg. 6(1)(b), Environmental Information Regulations]

All the above-noted documents are on the IPCC WG1 website at <http://www.ipcc-wg1.unibe.ch/publications/guidancpaper/guidancenotes.html>

7) IPCC

a. IPCC_Plenary33_PanelDecisions

- i. ipcc-p33_communications-strategy.pdf
- ii. ipcc-p33_conflict-of-interest.pdf
- iii. ipcc-p33_governance-management.pdf
- iv. ipcc-p33_procedures.pdf

[Information excepted pursuant to Reg. 6(1)(b), Environmental Information Regulations]

All the above-noted documents are on the IPCC website at http://www.ipcc.ch/scripts/session_template.php?page=33ipcc.htm within the section entitled 'Decisions taken with respect to the review of IPCC processes and procedures'.

b. IPCC_Principles-Procedures

- i. ipcc-principles.pdf
- ii. ipcc-principles-appendix-a.pdf
- iii. ipcc-principles-appendix-a-annex-1.pdf
- iv. ipcc-principles-appendix-a-annex-2.pdf
- v. ipcc-principles-appendix-b.pdf
- vi. ipcc-principles appendix-c-annex-a.pdf

[Information excepted pursuant to Reg. 6(1)(b), Environmental Information Regulations]

All the above-noted documents are on the IPCC website, or on the IPCC WG1 website at <http://www.ipcc-wg1.unibe.ch/procedures/procedures.html>

8) Meeting Reports

- a. AlternativeMetrics_MeetingReport.pdf
- b. Detection-Attribution_MeetingReport.pdf
- c. MultiModelEvaluation_MeetingReport.pdf
- d. SeaLevelRise-IceSheetInstabilities_WorkshopReport.pdf

[Information excepted pursuant to Reg. 6(1)(b), Environmental Information Regulations]

All the above-noted documents are on the IPCC WG1 website at <http://www.ipcc-wg1.unibe.ch/publications/supportingmaterial/supportingmaterial.html>

9) Resources

- a. WG1AR5_ElectronicResources.pdf

[Information excepted pursuant to Reg. 12(5)(a) & (f), Environmental Information Regulations]

- b. WG1AR5_EndNoteReferencing_QuickGuide-ProblemSolving.pdf
- c. WG1AR5_EndNoteReferencingGuide.pdf
- d. WG1AR5_StyleGuide.pdf

Items 9(b), 9(c) and 9(d) are within the attached .zip file, Appendix A_IPCC documentation

10) ZOD

a. Drafts

- i. WG1AR5_ZOD_AnnexI_Final.pdf
- ii. WG1AR5_ZOD_AnnexII_Final.pdf
- iii. WG1AR5_ZOD_Ch01_All_Final.pdf
- iv. WG1AR5_ZOD_Ch02_All_Final.pdf
- v. WG1AR5_ZOD_Ch03_All_Final.pdf
- vi. WG1AR5_ZOD_Ch04_All_Final.pdf
- vii. WG1AR5_ZOD_Ch05_All_Final.pdf
- viii. WG1AR5_ZOD_Ch06_All_Final.pdf
- ix. WG1AR5_ZOD_Ch07_All_Final.pdf
- x. WG1AR5_ZOD_Ch08_All_Final.pdf
- xi. WG1AR5_ZOD_Ch09_All_Final.pdf
- xii. WG1AR5_ZOD_Ch10_All_Final.pdf
- xiii. WG1AR5_ZOD_Ch11_All_Final.pdf
- xiv. WG1AR5_ZOD_Ch12_All_Final.pdf
- xv. WG1AR5_ZOD_Ch13_All_Final.pdf
- xvi. WG1AR5_ZOD_Ch14_All_Final.pdf

[Information excepted pursuant to Reg. 12(5)(a) & (f), Environmental Information Regulations]

b. ExtendedOutline

- i. WG1AR5_ZOD_ExtendedOutline.pdf

[Information excepted pursuant to Reg. 12(5)(a) & (f), Environmental Information Regulations]

c. FAQs

- i. WG1AR5_ZOD_FAQs.pdf

[Information excepted pursuant to Reg. 12(5)(a) & (f), Environmental Information Regulations]

5. Additional material added by participants to memory stick

- 1) IPCC_WGI_AR5_Chapter6_FOD_figs_v0.doc

[Information excepted pursuant to Reg. 12(4)(d), 12(5)(a) & 12(5)(f), Environmental Information Regulations]

2) IPCC_WGI_AR5_Chapter6_FOD_text_v0.doc

[Information excepted pursuant to Reg. 12(4)(d), 12(5)(a) & 12(5)(f), Environmental Information Regulations]

3) Section6.3_new outline.ppt

[Information excepted pursuant to Reg. 12(4)(d), 12(5)(a) & 12(5)(f), Environmental Information Regulations]