

Mr Andrew Watson

request-80925-04852a0d@whatdotheyknow.com

Our Reference: FOI 155/11
ICO Decision Notice FS50421702
6th June 2012

Dear Mr Watson,

I am writing with reference to your request for information regarding Project Lantern, dated 30th August 2011, made under section 1(1) of the Freedom of Information Act and the subsequent Decision Notice issued by the Information Commissioner on 02 May 2012. In his Decision Notice, the Information Commissioner required the NPIA to either disclose the information you requested or issue a valid refusal notice citing a valid exemption.

You asked for the following information:

Please send me the following documents relating to Project Lantern:

- 1. The final report on the project.*
- 2. "Lantern Technical Options Paper – evaluation of fingerprint sensor technologies" by Ambika Suman.*
- 3. "Lantern performance and scalability report", (CCN014R2-20.2-1.0 dated 17 July 2007).*
- 4. Any later revision of (3) above provided to NPIA in response to recommendation 4 in "Lantern Project – The Way Forward" (IDT004-0101-project way forward - project board recommendations 080403 v0-1).*
- 5. "LANTERN Service Expansion Test Summary Report" (Document ID 4 in section 4.2 of "Contract Change Note 050 IDENT1-LANTERN Service Expansion").*
- 6. Any report held by NPIA resulting from an evaluation of the Fingerprint False Match Rate (FMR) and False Non-Match Rate (FNMR) achieved in the field during the LANTERN trial. (Question as revised in request received on 30/08/2011).*

The NPIA can confirm that it holds the following information:

- Lantern Technical Options Paper – evaluation of fingerprint sensor technologies

NPIA (headquarters)
Fry Building
2 Marsham Street
London
SW1P 4DF

T 0203 113 6000
www.npia.police.uk

- Engineering Report: Lantern Performance and Scalability; CCN014R2-20.2-1.0 dated 17 July 2007

The NPPIA can also confirm that the following information is not held:

- A final report on Project Lantern. The Lantern Project closed on 31st July 2011 and a final report on the project has not yet been written.
- LANTERN Service Expansion Test Summary Report (Document ID 4 in section 4.2 of Contract Change Note 050 IDENT1-LANTERN Service Expansion). The change control notice that would have resulted in the expansion of the LANTERN Service was never actioned and therefore no Test Summary Report was produced.
- A later revision to Engineering Report: Lantern Performance and Scalability; CCN014R2-20.2-1.0 dated 17 July 2007. None of the options presented to the Project Board were pursued and therefore recommendation 4 of the 'Lantern Project – The Way Forward' report was not proceeded with.

The NPPIA is unable to confirm whether it holds any reports resulting from an evaluation of the Fingerprint False Match Rate (FMR) and False Non-Match Rate (FNMR) achieved in the field during the LANTERN trial as we estimate that to do so would exceed the cost limit specified in Regulations. As a result, the NPPIA is exempt from confirming if this information is held by virtue of Section 12(2) of the Freedom of Information Act and is exempt from complying with your request by virtue of Section 12(1).

Application of Exemption

Section 12(1) of the Freedom of Information Act does not oblige a public authority to comply with a request for information if the cost of complying exceeds a cost limit, known as the 'appropriate limit', which is specified in the Freedom of Information and Data Protection (Appropriate Limit and Fees) Regulations 2004. Section 12(2) of the Freedom of Information Act does not oblige a public authority to confirm or deny that information is held if the cost of complying with this requirement alone exceeds the same cost limit.

For public authorities such as the NPPIA, the cost limit has been set at £450. These costs are limited to those that an authority reasonably expects to incur in:

- determining whether it holds the information requested,
- locating the information or documents containing the information,
- retrieving such information or documents, and
- extracting the information from the document containing it.

The Regulations also specify that costs which are attributable to the time spent by staff undertaking any of the activities mentioned above are to be calculated at a

standard rate of £25 per hour. This represents the estimated cost of one person spending a maximum of 18 hours (2½ working days) complying with a request.

We have identified two high level folders relating to the Lantern project within the NPPIA's main digital file storage area. These contain 3812 documents of various types including documents, spreadsheet, emails, presentations, project plans, PDF files and HTML files. This does not include any documents that may be stored in personal storage areas or emails in personal mailboxes.

Of the 3812 files referred to above, 3599 are stored within 139 separate Zip files. The NPPIA's document stores are only electronically searchable using the standard Windows-based search tool. No other search utilities have been deployed on the NPPIA file servers. The Windows search cannot search within the contents of a Zip file nor within the content of an email so, in order to locate the information you have requested, it would be necessary to either export the contents of the Zip files to a location that was searchable or carry out a manual search of the items stored within the Zip files.

Having evaluated the first option, it was felt that exporting this volume of data across the network would have a significant impact on the performance of the network and would still not obviate the need to carry out a manual search of certain file types, such as emails. In addition, it was found that, dependant on the number and size of files held within each Zip file, it could take up to 15 minutes to export the entire contents from a single Zip file and this resulted in a number of errors being encountered. It was therefore felt this was not a viable option in order to search for the requested information and that a manual search would be the only viable option.

It must be noted that false matches and non-matches are also referred to in documentation by other terms including false accepts, false rejects and misses and a simple search based on the terms specified in your request may not retrieve all relevant information. It would require someone with some degree of knowledge of the subject area to search and determine if a document falls into the category specified in your request.

We have carried out some tests to establish how long it would take a member of staff with a moderate level of knowledge of the subject matter to open and review a document to establish if it contains the requested information. The results vary widely dependant on the size and type of document from a matter of seconds to several minutes and it has therefore been difficult to establish a definitive benchmark. However, with this in mind, and allowing for the repetitive nature of the task, we have estimated it would take on average 30 seconds to open and review a document to establish if it is likely to contain the requested information. Based on this estimate we have calculated it would take approximately 29 hours to review the files held in the two Lantern folders equating to a cost of £725. Without taking into consideration the additional information which may be held in personal

storage areas and mailboxes, this exceeds the cost limit specified in the Regulations.

Having determined that an exemption under Section 12 of the Act is engaged, the NPPIA is not obliged to comply with your request.

Section 16 – Advice and Assistance

Under section 16 of the Freedom of Information Act and with due regard to the Code of Practice issued under Section 45 of the Act, the NPPIA are obliged to offer appropriate advice and assistance to persons seeking information from us.

In view of the way that the information is stored, it would be difficult for us to offer further advice as to how your request could be refined to bring it within cost. Any one of a number of folders and Zip files might contain information falling within the categories specified in your request and we don't feel it would be particularly helpful to you if we provided you with a list of these folders/Zip files in order for you to select areas for us to search as the file and folder descriptions are not a completely accurate reflection of the contents. However, as part of this review, we have already undertaken an electronic content search of the 213 files held outside of the Zip files and found no information relating to the terms specified in your request.

As a result of the searches already undertaken, we have located a document called the Lantern Accuracy Analysis Engineering Report. Whilst this document is not an evaluation of results achieved in the field as part of the Lantern trial, it does contain information about the tested accuracy of Lantern.

We therefore feel we could retrieve the following information within the cost limit:

- Lantern Technical Options Paper – evaluation of fingerprint sensor technologies
- Engineering Report: Lantern Performance and Scalability; CCN014R2-20.2-1.0 dated 17 July 2007
- Lantern Accuracy Analysis Engineering Report CCN014R2-020.1-1.0; dated 30 November 2006

Please be aware that these documents have not been evaluated to determine if there would be any harm in disclosure and whether any of the information contained in any of them would attract an exemption from disclosure. Such an evaluation would be carried out at the time a further request was received.

If you wish to receive the information described above, please let us know.

Your right to complain

National Policing Improvement Agency

We take our responsibilities under the Freedom of Information Act seriously but, if you feel your request has not been properly handled or you are otherwise dissatisfied with the outcome of your request, you have the right to complain. We will investigate the matter and endeavour to reply within 20 working days. You should write to:

Anne Taylor
Head of Secretariat and Policing Portfolio Unit

C/O FOI Team
National Policing Improvement Agency
10th Floor (East),
New King's Beam House,
22 Upper Ground,
London,
SE1 9QY
E-mail: NPIAFOI.InternalReviews@npia.pnn.police.uk

If you are still dissatisfied following our internal review, you have the right, under section 50 of the Act, to complain directly to the Information Commissioner. Before considering your complaint, the Information Commissioner would normally expect you to have exhausted the complaints procedures provided by the NPIA. The Information Commissioner can be contacted at:

FOI Compliance Team (complaints)
Wycliffe House
Water Lane
Wilmslow
Cheshire
SK9 5AF

Further information about the NPIA is routinely published on our website at www.npia.police.uk or through our publication scheme. If you require any further assistance in connection with this request please contact us at our address above.

Yours sincerely,

Guy Flintham

Knowledge and Information Management Services Adviser
National Policing Improvement Agency