SECOND PUBLIC EXAMINATION

HONOUR SCHOOL OF ENGLISH LANGUAGE AND LITERATURE

COURSE II

A4 Introduction to Textual Criticism

TRINITY TERM 2014

Thursday, 29 May, 2.30pm - 5.45pm

Time allowed - Three hours plus fifteen minutes reading time

Answer BOTH questions 1 and 2.

You may write on the same text in more than one answer, but you should not repeat material. You should pay careful attention in your answers to the precise terms of the quotations and questions.

Do not turn over until told to do so

1. Choose THREE of (a) to (d)

(a) Evaluate the interpretative stance underlying these two translations of *Exodus*, both published posthumously. Tolkien's Old English text is provided for comparison.

Then the native host, greatest of nations was plagued to death with dire punishments:

their treasure-wardens felled, bereft of wealth, hall-joys slept--souls of woe rose on high--at midnight had God annihilated those persecutors, slain their first-born cut down their defenders. Death's angel, hateful, struck widely, stifled the land

with corpse upon corpse--the troop departed.
Weeping was widespread, worldly joys few,

the laughter-smith's hands locked helplessly, when the people, the departing host,

45 went their hateful way, to Pharaoh's woe.

Heaven came there, destroyed the hellish shrines, the idols. That was a glorious day on mid-earth when the multitude set out.

Thus one accursed Egyptian crew

50 endured confinement ever after because they thought they would ever thwart, if God consented, Moses' kinsmen's dear journey that was so long yearned for.

The army was made ready, active

55 the bold leader who led their nation.

He passed with that folk many a fortress,
the habitations of hostile men,
through narrow defiles, on unknown paths,
till they reached the warlike borderers

60 whose lands lay covered by protecting clouds.
Beyond these mainland dwellings Moses
led his army then through many lands.

XLIII Then two nights after they had escaped their foes, he bade his glory-filled force encamp on the outskirts of Etham,

with noise and clamor echoing among that huge military host.

Stanley B. Greenfield, translation of Exodus, in the Old English Newsletter (1987)

the march from Egypt. At that time still newly was the greatest of proud peoples smitten mortally with the plagues of old. At the fall of their princes lamentation was renewed, mirth was hushed in the halls bereft of treasure. The fell destroyer had at midnight with cruel stroke laid low every

first-born child and crushed the lords of cities: far and wide the Slayer ranged grievously afflicting the people. The land was dark with corpses of the dead. Forth marched the host!—wailing was on every side, little the merriment of men; palsied were the hands of the makers of mirth. It was allowed that people to enter upon their begrudged journey—a nation on the march. The Fiend was robbed. The fanes toppled to Lamentation entered there. The idols of the devil were thrown down. Renowned throughout the world was the day when that multitude set out; albeit the folk of Egypt, accursed of old, had wrought thus treacherously for many a year, in that they purposed to deny for ever, had God permitted them, 45 to Moses' kin, to their unceasing longing, that desiréd march.

Eager was the army to go; high the heart of him who led their kindred, the chieftain young and bold. With that folk he marched past many a fastness, many a land and habitation of unfriendly men, filing down narrow paths and ways 50 unsearched, until they bore their arms against the warlike people on the marches. Their lands were canopied with a cloudy veil, border-dwellings builded upon the moorward slopes; through which Moses led the army of men most valiant. Then when two nights were past since they had 55 escaped their foes he bade the men triumphant to set their camp in clamorous company, with their invading host and power most mighty, about Etham's cities upon the border-lands. Perforce they had adventured into the northern

Joan Turville-Petre (ed.), The Old English Exodus: Text, Translation and Commentary by J. R. R. Tolkien (1981)

(b) Consider the presentation and lay-out of the text in this translation and edition of the Sermo Lupi.

from Sermo Lupi ad Anglos (Wulfstan's address to the English)

... In this time, many on earth are multiply blemished

by the mainings of sin.

In this time

minister-killers and minster-

are man-slayers, kin-slayers,

haters.

In this time

there are perjurers and murderers,

meretrixes and bairn-smotherers,

and the filthy whoring

of foul fornicators.

And in this time there are spell-makers and sorceresses.

And in this time

there are plunderers, predators

and, to be brief,

a countless number of all manner

And this causes us no shame! Rather, it should concern us as the books teach us,

among this wretched, vile But again – much may still

a great deal that would witness

things are at this time

Urgent it is that we look, consider, Therefore, and in the name of God, and protect, guard ourselves,

else we were all to perish together...

and preying spoliators -

of crimes and misdemeanours.

that we begin atonement, and that this should be witnessed and vice-corrupted people. be called to mind, and too easily, that would escape a mere one man's momentary consideration, how continually wretched everywhere among this folk. nor leave the looking too long. let us act as is necessary, as with grace we may,

Chris McCully (trans.), Old English Poems and Riddles (2008)

Hēr syndan þurh synlēawa°, swā hit þincan mæg, sāre gelēwede° tō manege on earde. Hēr syndan mannslagan and mægslagan and mæsserbanan° and mynsterhatan°, and hēr syndan mānsworan° and morþorwyrhtan, and hēr syndan myltestran° and bearnmyrðran° and fūle forlegene° hōringas° manege, and hēr syndan rwiccan and wælcyrian¹, and hēr syndan ryperas and rēaferas

and worolstrüderas° and, hrædest is to cwebenne, 'māna and misdæda ungerīm ealra'. And þæs° üs ne scamað nā, ac üs scamað swyþe þæt we bote āginnan°, swā swā bec tæcan, and þæt is gesyne on þysse earman forsyngodan þeode. Ēalā, 'micel magan manege gyt hertoeacan eaþe bebencan, þæs þe' ān man ne mehte on hrædinge° āsmeagan° hū° earmlīce° hit gefaren° is nū ealle hwīle wīde gynd þās þeode. And 'smeage hūru georne gehwā° hine sylfne and þæs° nā ne latige' ealles to lange. Ac lā, on Godes naman utan° don swā üs neod is, beorgan ūs sylfum swā we geornost magan þē læs we ætgædere ealle forweorðan°.

140

145

133 injuries of sin hurt 134 priest-slayers 135 enemies of monasteries perjurers136 whores child-killers adulterous fornicators

138 pillagers 139 for that begin 142 hurry deal with (about) how wretched gone 143 everyone in respect of that 144 let us 145 perish

137 wiccan and wælcyrian 'witches and sorcerers'. There are frequent references to witchcraft in church laws and penitentials. *Wælcyrian* (lit. 'choosers of the slain') must refer to some specific kind of witch or supernatural being; the word is cognate with 'valkyrie'.

138-9 māna and misdæda ungerīm ealra 'a countless number of all crimes and misdeeds'.

141 micel... behencan The subj. is manege, the obj. micel: 'many yet can easily bring to mind much in addition'. bæs be 'to the extent that'.

143-4 smēage... latige sbj. vbs. with optative meaning; the subj. of the sentence is *gehwā*: 'let everyone examine... hesitate'.

Richard Marsden (ed.), The Cambridge Old English Reader (2004)

(c) Discuss how the text and the editorial apparatus cater to the needs of the audience in these two editions of *Ancrene Wisse*.

'Me, Lauerd!' þu seist, 'hwerto? Ne mahte he wið leasse gref habben arud us?' 3eoi, iwiss, ful lihtliche; ah he nalde. 525 For hwi? Forte bineomen us euch bitellunge azein him of ure luue pet he se deore bohte. Me bud lihtliche ping pet me luued lutel. He bohte us wið his heorte blod-deorre pris nes neauer -forte ofdrahen of us ure luue toward him, bet costnede him se sare. I scheld beoð þreo þinges—þe treo, ant te leðer, ant 530 te litunge. Alswa wes i þis scheld-þe treo of þe rode, þet leðer of Godes licome, be litunge of be reade blod bet heowede hire se feire. Eft pe pridde reisun: efter kene cnihtes dead me hongeð hehe i chirche his scheld on his mungunge. Alswa is pis scheld, pet is pe crucifix, i chirche iset i swuch stude per 535 me hit sonest seo, forte penchen perbi o Iesu Cristes cnihtschipe þet he dude o rode. His leofmon bihalde þron hu he bohte hire luue-lette purlin his scheld, openin his side to schawin hire his heorte, to schawin hire openliche hu inward- f. 106 liche he luuede hire, ant to ofdrahen hire heorte.

Fowr heaued-luuen me ifind i þis world: bitweone gode 541 iferen, bitweone mon ant wummon, bitweone wif ant hire child, bitweone licome ant sawle. Þe luue þet Iesu Crist haueð to his deore leofmon ouergeað þeos fowre, passeð ham alle. Ne teleð me him god fere þe leið his wed i Giwerie to 545 acwitin ut his fere? Godd Almihti leide himseolf for us i Giwerie, ant dude his deorewurðe bodi to acwitin ut his leofmon of Giwene honden. Neauer fere ne dude swuch fordede for his fere.

542 second bitweone] MS. bi

526. bitellunge: H 286. 24-26 Pur tolir nous chescune de [fense] et surdit encontre li de nostre amour. Tr. 143. 32-144. 1 is quite different and probably corrupt.

533-4. Lancelot's action in La Mort le Roi Artu, before he goes into exile abroad from which he does not expect to return, is similar:

'Pren mon escu en cele chambre et t'en va droit a Kamaalot, et si le porte en la mestre eglise de Saint Estienne et le lesse en tel leu ou il puisse remanoir et ou il soit bien veuz, si que tuit cil qui des ore mes le verront aient en remenbrance les merveilles que ge ai fetes en ceste terre. Et sez tu por quoi ge faz a cel leu ceste enneur? por ce que ge i reçui primes l'ordre de chevalerie; si en aing plus la cité que nule autre; et por ce voil je que mes escuz i soit en leu de moi, car je ne sai se james aventure m'i amenra' (ed. J. Frappier (1936), ch. 120, p. 137. 2-10).

"Me, Laverd," thu seist, "hwer-to ne mahte he with leasse gref habben arud us?" Yeoi, i-wiss, ful lihtliche, ah he nalde. For-hwi? For-te bineomen us euch bitellunge ayein him of ure luve thet he se deore bohte. Me buth lihtliche thing thet me luveth lutel. He bohte us with his heorte blod — deorre pris nes neaver —

for-te ofdrahen of us ure luve toward him, thet costnede him se sare. I scheld beoth threo thinges: the treo, ant te lether, ant te litunge. Alswa wes i this scheld the treo of the rode, thet lether of Godes licome, the litunge of the reade blod thet heowede hire se feire. Eft the thridde reisun: efter kene cnihtes death, me hongeth hehe i chirche his scheld on his mungunge. Alswa is this scheld — thet is, the crucifix — i chirche i-set i swuch stude ther me hit sonest seo, for-te thenchen ther-bi o Jesu Cristes cnihtschipe, thet he dude o rode. His leofmon bihalde th'ron hu he bohte hire luve, lette thurlin his scheld, openin his side, to schawin hire his heorte, to schawin hire openliche hu inwardliche he luvede hire, ant to ofdrahen hire heorte.

Fowr heaved luven me i-find i this world: bitweone gode i-feren, bitweone mon ant wummon, bi[tweone] wif ant hire child, bitweone licome ant sawle. The luve thet Jesu Crist haveth to his deore leofmon overgeath theos fowre, passeth ham alle. Ne teleth me him god fere the leith his wed i Giwerie to acwitin ut his fere? Godd almihti leide him-seolf for us i Giwerie ant dude his deore-wurthe bodi to

acwitin ut his leofmon of Giwene honden. Neaver fere ne dude swuch fordede for his fere.

98-100 "Me, Laverd"

... deore bohte, "But, Lord," you say, "could He not have saved us with less suffering (lit., grief)?" Yes, certainly, [He could have] very easily, but He did not want to. Why? To deprive us of each excuse [we might give] to Him for [not giving] our love which He bought so dearly (or, expensively). 100-02 Me buth ... se sare, One buys cheaply a thing which one loves little. He bought us with His heart's blood — there was never a dearer (or,

more expensive) price - in order to win (lit., draw forth) from us our love for Him, which cost Him so heavily. 103 tree, wood; litunge, coloring, painting. 104 thet, the (old neuter def. art.); licome, body. 105 heowede hire se feire, colored it (lit., her, the cross/shield) so fairly (or, beautifully); Eft, In turn. 105-06 efter kene cnihtes death ... his mungunge, after a brave knight's death, the people hang his shield high in the church in his memory. 107-08 i swuch stude ... o rode, in such a place where one [may] see it soonest (i.e., most easily), in order to think, through it (lit., thereby), of Jesus Christ's chivalry which He did on the Cross. 108-09 His leofmon ... openin his side, Let His lover see in it (lit., thereon) how He bought her love, [how He] let His shield be pierced, His side be opened. 110 inwardliche, deeply (or, sincerely); to ofdrahen, to draw forth (or, win). 112-13 Four heaved luven ... ant sawle, Four main (or, chief) loves one finds (i-find = reduced form of i-findeth) in this world: between good companions, between man and woman, between a woman and her child, between body and soul. 114 leofmon, leman (or, lover); overgeath, surpasses. 115-17 Ne teleth me him ... of Giwene honden, Does one not account him (i.e., that person) a good companion who lays his pledge (i.e., collateral) in Jewry (i.e., among Jewish moneylenders) to acquit his companion out [of debt]? God almighty laid Himself for us in Jewry (i.e., in the hands of the Jews) and put His precious body up [as a pledge] to acquit (or, release) His beloved out of the hands of the Jews,

100

105

110

- the thridde reisun. Exactly what the first two reasons are is somewhat unclear. R. A. Waldron, analyzing the AW author's tendency to number his arguments, offers the following explanation: "The three answers which he gives to this question [see 7.98–99] are (i) to deprive us of all excuse for refusing Him our love ... [7.99–100], (ii) to attract
 - our own love by the price He paid for it . . . [7.102], and (iii) to demonstrate His love openly [7.110]" ("Enumeration in Ancrene Wisse," p. 87).
- 108 ff. Both Anselm's Meditation on Human Redemption (see Ward's translation, pp. 230–37) and Bernard Sermons on the Song of Songs 11.7 (PL 183, col. 827) advance similar arguments for the necessity of the crucifixion (Savage and Watson, p. 399n17).
- 112 ff. Fowr heaved luven. Dobson points to a very close parallel between the four loves as described here in the Moralities on the Gospels (pp. 173 ff.), while Rouse and Wenzel (in their review of Dobson's Moralities on the Gospels) point to other analogues, among them in the Summa brevis of Richard Wetheringsette. Edward Wilson also identified a close parallel to the four loves in a sermon preserved in a late fifteenth-century manuscript (Lincoln Cathedral, MS 50). Shepherd lists a number of more general analogues (p. 59).
- Behind this story of the loyal friend lies the memory of the legendary friends Damon and Pythias. Shakespeare's *The Merchant of Venice* is a later handling of the same folkmotif. Though the antisemitism in this passage is drearily commonplace, there may be an echo of contemporary developments. As Shepherd writes, "The Jews in Henry II's reign had had a recognised place in the national economy and were much used by the king in the collection of money. From the beginning of Richard I's reign (1189), outrages directed against the financial monopoly of the Jews were numerous. Hatred was intensified by the fall of Jerusalem and during the preparation for the Third Crusade (1189–92)" (pp. 59–60). For more recent accounts of Christian-Jewish relations in this period, see Anna Sapir Abulafia's *Christians and Jews in the Twelfth Century Renaissance* and Andrew Colin Gow's *The Red Jews: Antisemitism in an Apocalyptic Age, 1200–1600*.
 - bi[tweone] wif ant hire child. MS: bi/wif ant hir child. As Tolkien (p. 200, fol. 106v, line 3) and Millett and Wogan-Browne (p. 116) point out, the scribe fails to copy the rest of bitweone ("between") after the line break.
 - MS: swuch fordede. Tolkien's note: "for or derived from forodede (OE. foroded")" (p. 201, fol. 106v, line 9). The MS reading, fordede "service, or deed of assistance," however, is most probably correct since both Nero and Titus (which often recast difficult passages) retain the form. The prefix here is presumably not the pejorative for- as in for-don "to destroy," but a prefix meaning "in behalf of." The MED thinks the word was formed on the basis of MLat. profecti. [Cleo.: swich forodede; Titus: swuch fordede; Nero: swuch fordede; Vernon (lost); Pepys: swich a fordede; Caius: swuch fordede.]

BLANK PAGE

TURN OVER

(d) What can these two extracts from editions of the Auchinleck and Ashmole manuscripts of Sir Orfeo tell us about the transmission of the text?

Look, Behold Lo,° was ther wepeing in the halle And grete cri among hem alle! With difficulty Unnethe° might old or yong For wepeing speke a word with tong. together Thai kneled a-doun al y-fere° And praid him, yif his wille were, beseeched/(it) were That he no schuld nought° fram hem go-"Do way!" quath he, "It schal be so!" Al his kingdom he forsoke; Bot a sclavin on him he toke.4 He no hadde kirtel° no hode, tunic/hood Schert, no no nother gode-Bot his harp he tok algate,° anyway, nevertheless And dede him barfot out atte gate; betook, went/barefoot No man most° with him go. might O, way!" What ther was wepe and wo alas When he that hadde ben king with croun Went so poverlich⁶ out of toun! Thurth[°] wode and over heth[°] Through/heath Into the wildernes he geth.° goes Nothing he fint that him is ays,7 Bot ever he liveth in gret malais.° discomfort He that hadde y-werd the fowe and griis, And on bed the purper biis--Now on hard hethe he lith,° lies

With leves and gresse° he him writh.° He that hadde had castels and tours, River, forest, frith with flours, Now, thei' it comenci' to snewe' and frese, This king mot make his bed in mese. He that had y-had knightes of priis Bifor him kneland,° and levedis,

Now seth° he nothing that him liketh;° Bot° wilde wormes° bi him striketh.° He that had y-had plenté Of mete and drink, of ich deynté,° Now may he al day digge and wrote° Er° he finde his fille of rote.°

grass/covers

though / commenced / snow excellence, esteem kneeling/ladies sees / pleases Only/snakes/slide

> delicacy root about Before / roots

In gray woods. (On the possible senses of the expression, see Sir Launfal, 1. 171, n.)
 Cf. I. 126. (So begins a sequence of echoes of earlier details and/or phrases; the effect is to redouble the sense of absolute disparity between that which is lost and that which remains.)
 Do away (with all that)!
 He took only a pilgrim's mantle about him. (The choice of raiment suggests an intention to go on some kind of pilgrimage, but it is soon made clear that Orfeo seeks no kind of spiritual enlightenment or consolation of the kind traditionally sought by pilgrims.)

enlightenment or consolation of the kind traditionally sought by pligrims.)

Shirt, nor any other possession.

Le., in such a state of poverty.

He finds nothing to his ease. (The description of Orfeo's hardship employs repeated contrasts with his past well-being; the method is also employed above, ll. 105-8, in Orfeo's reflections on his wife's distress. The poem thus draws special attention to the conditions of possession and completion as defined by their opposites.)

He who had worn the variegated and gray fur, and who had covering his bed the fine purple linen. (Some trappings of royalty; the fur appears to have been variegated with alternating strips in gray and white—cf. Sir Launfal, l. 237; on purple cloth, see Ywain and Gawain,

Ther was wepyng in the halle, And gret sorow among them alle; Ther was nether olde ne yong That myght speke a word wyth tong. 225 They felle on kneys all in fere,74 Besought hym iff hys wyll were, That he schuld not fro them go. "Do wey!" he seyd, "it schall be so! All thys kyngdom I forsake!" A staff to hym he gan take — 230 He had nether gowne ne hode, Schert, ne non other gode, Bot an harpe he toke, algate 75— Barefote he went furth at the gate. 235 Ther was weping and grete crye, Grete dole, for the maysterye,76 When the kyng wythouten crounne So porely went out off the tounne. He went thorow wode and hethe, 240 And into wyldernes he gethe;

214

So fer he went, I sey iwys,77 That he wyst not wher he was. He that sate in boure and halle, And on hym were the purpull palle,78 245 Now in herd heth he lygheth,79 Wyth levys and gress his body hydyth. He that had knyghtys off pryse, And before hym knelyd ladys, He sey not that hys herte lykyth,80 250 Bot wyld bestys that by hym strykyth.81 Also he had castells and tourys, Forestys, ryverse, frutys, and flourys -Now thoff it be store as frese,82 He may not make hys bed in es.83 255 The kyng that had grete plenté Off mete and drink, wythouten le, Long he may dyge and wrote84 Or he have hys fyll of the rote.

 ⁷¹ lost 72 ms. wylderne 73 wild woods 74 together
 75 however 76 the very greatest

⁷⁷ truly 78 wore the fine clothes of royalty 79 on hard ground he lies; ms. ly3et 80 saw nothing congenial to him 81 went, ran

⁸² though the cold be bitter as freezing
83 may not find a comfortable bed
84 root, delve

2. Respond to ONE of the following:

- a) 'Textual criticism is the process of ascertaining and reproducing what an author wrote' (MICHAEL LAPIDGE).
- b) 'Do not venerate the scribes alone but dare to think for yourself' (RICHARD BENTLEY).

Evaluate this advice to the potential textual critic.

c) 'The days when editorial giants stalked the earth are over, and their bones will be preserved in the compacted detritus of the printezoic era' (PATRICK CONNER).

Will electronic editions, as Conner suggests, make printed editions obsolete?

- d) 'The possibility must be faced that they [Old English poems] are composite products of two, or very likely more, minds, which were not necessarily working towards the same end' (DOUGLAS MOFFAT).
- e) 'Each manuscript must be recognised as having authoritative virtue' (JOYCE HILL).

LAST PAGE

For Question 1 a) Tolkien's Old English Text is provided below:

 þa wæs ungeara ealdum witum deaðe gedrecced drihtfolca mæst—
 hordwearda hryre heaf wæs geniwad, swæfon seledreamas since berofene; hæfde mansceaða æt middere niht frecne gefylled frumbearna géhwylc, abrocene burhweardas. Bana wide scrað,

lað leodhata. Land drysmode deadra hræwum. Dugoð forð gewat wop wæs wide, worulddreama lyt; wæron hleahtorsmiðum handa belocene; alyfed laðsið leode gretan—

45' folc ferende. Feond wæs bereafod.
Hergas onheldon—heof þider becom—druron deofolgyld. Dæg wæs mære ofer middangeard þa seo mengeo for; swa þæs facen dreah fela missera

50 ealdwerigra Egypta folc, bæs be hie wideferð wyrnan bohton Moyses magum, gif hie Metod lete, on langne lust leofes siðes. Fyrd wæs gefysed; from se ðe lædde,

modig magoræswa, mægburh heora.
Oferfor he mid þy folce fæstenna worn,
land and leodweard laðra manna,
enge anpaðas, uncuð gelad,
oð þæt hie on guðmyrce gearwe bæron.

60 Wæron land heora lyfthelme beheaht, mearchofu morheald. Moyses ofer ha

felamodigra fyrde gelædde. Heht þa ymb twa niht tirfæste hæleð, siððan hie feondum oðfaren hæfdon,

65 ymbwicigean werodes bearhtme mid ælfære Æthanes byrig, mægnes mæste, mearclandum on.

33 ungeara] ingere MS 34 gedrecced] gedrenced MS; renced in larger later hand over erasure 37 mansceaða] 38 gehwylc T.] fela MS 40 drysmode Sedgefield] dryrmyde MS 45 P. 145 begins feond Thorpe] freond MS 46 onheldon T.] on helle MSheof T.] heofon MS 49 facen T.) fæsten MS 50 ealdwerigra Sievers2] -werige MS 55 magoræswa Thorpe] mago ræwa MS 56 fæstenna Sievers²] ena MS

62 felamodigra T.] fela meoringa MS
63 P. 146 begins with EHT and space for large init. cap. tirfæste Bouterwek²] -ne MS
66 ælfære] ælf ere MS
Æthanes] h suprascript MS

Joan Turville-Petre (ed.), The Old English Exodus: Text, Translation and Commentary by J. R. R. Tolkien (1981)