

DENB 2407

SECOND PUBLIC EXAMINATION

HONOUR SCHOOL OF ENGLISH LANGUAGE AND LITERATURE 2009

COURSE II

A4 Introduction to Textual Criticism

TRINITY TERM 2009

Thursday, 28 May, 9.15 a.m.- 12.30 p.m.

Time allowed – Three hours plus fifteen minutes reading time

Answer BOTH questions.

You may write on the same text in more than one answer, but you should not repeat material. You should pay careful attention in your answers to the precise terms of the quotations and questions.

Do *not* turn over until told to do so

Answer BOTH questions

You may write on the same text in more than one answer, but you should not repeat material. You should pay careful attention in your answers to the precise terms of the quotations and questions.

1. Choose THREE of the passages (a) to (d)

(a) Examine in detail how the presentation of the text and the editorial apparatus guides a historical and linguistic reading of the *Sermo Lupi*.

gelepede to manege on earde. Her syndan mannslaȝan
7 mæȝsȝan 7 mæsserbanan 7 mynsterhatan, 7 her
syndan mǎnsȝoran 7 mǎrȝorȝrhtan, 7 her syndan
myltestran 7 bearnmyrȝoran 7 fule forleȝene horingas
manege, 7 her syndan piccan 7 pælcȝrian, 7 her syndan
ȝyperas 7 reaferas 7 porolstruderan, 7, hrædest is to
cpeþenne, mǎna 7 misdæda ūȝerim ealra. 7 þæs us
ne scamað na, ac us scamað spyþe þæt pe bote aȝinnan
spa spa bec tæcan, 7 þæt is ȝesȝne on þysse earmān for-

synȝodan þeode. Eala, micel maȝan manege ȝȝt her-
toeacan eaþe beþencan (fol. 114b) þæs þe an man ne mehte
on hrædinge asmeaȝan, hu earmlice hit ȝefaren is nu ealle
hpile pide ȝȝnd þas þeode. 7 smeaȝe huru ȝeorne ȝehpa
hine sylfne 7 þæs na ne latiȝe ealles to lanȝe. Ac la, on ¹⁸⁰
ȝodes naman, utan don spa us neod is, beoȝan us sylfum
spa pe ȝeornost maȝan, þe læs pe ætȝædere ealle for-
peorðan.

An þeodpita pæs on Brytta tidum, ȝildas hatte, se
aprat be heora misdædum, hu hy mid heora synnum spa ¹⁸⁵
oferlice spyþe ȝod ȝeȝræmedan þæt he let æt nyhstan
Enȝla here heora eard ȝepinnan 7 Brytta dūȝeþe fordon
mid ealle.

¹⁸⁷ After syndan E adds *spa pe ær sædon*. ¹⁸⁸ mæsserbanan : E sacerdbanan; after mynsterhatan E adds 7 hlafordspican 7 æbere apostatan. ¹⁸⁹ After mǎrȝorȝrhtan E adds 7 her syndan hǎdbrecan 7 æþbrecan 7 ðurh sibȝeȝeru 7 ðurh mistlice forȝeȝeru forsȝȝode spyðe. ¹⁹⁰ r of myltestran added above. ¹⁹¹ A letter erased after manege; pælcȝrian : e erased after c, E pælcerian. ¹⁹² After porolstruderan E adds 7 ðeofas 7 þeodscadān 7 þeodȝan 7 þeodȝan. ¹⁹⁴ After ac E adds þæs; aȝinnan corrected from aȝunnan.

¹⁸⁷ gelepede : this word, which occurs also in XVI, and the geleped in Ælfric (S. J. Crawford, *Heptateuch* 268), which renders *debilitatum*, are better taken as p.pt. of a derivative verb from læp 'blemish' than as from læpan 'to betray'.

¹⁸⁹ bearnmyrȝoran : Professor Dickins has suggested that the Scandinavian custom of exposing infants may be included in this condemnation; for this see Margaret Schlauch, *Romance in Iceland* 96.

¹⁹¹ piccan 7 pælcȝrian : except in Napier LVII and the Cnut proclamation (v. note to ll. 166-73), this phrase is not otherwise recorded in OE, but it appears as *wychez and walkyries* in the fourteenth-century alliterative poem, *Purity*, l. 1577 (v. BT s.v. *wælcȝȝe*). *pælcȝȝie* is used to gloss classical names, i.e. of the Furies, a Gorgon, Bellona and once Venus. No instance is earlier than the late tenth century and probably the word is a Scandinavian introduction (cf. ON *valkyrja*, on which see Snorra Edda, *Gylfaginn-*ing c. 36, tr. A. E. Brodeur). Wulfstan presumably means by it some kind of witch, though the glosses show that it could refer to a supernatural being. The OE *pælceaseȝa* 'chooser of the slain' occurs in the poem *Exodus*, l. 164, but is applied to a bird of carrion.

References to witchcraft are common in church laws and penitentials, and occur also in X and in Ælfric's *De Auguriis* (*Lives of Saints*, ed. W. W. Skeat I. XVII, ll. 110 ff). The most interesting example of belief in witchcraft is in a charter (BCS 1131 = Robertson XXXVII), which mentions the outlawry of a man and the drowning of a woman for an offence that comes under this heading (cf. II As 6).

¹⁹⁰ on hrædinge : this is the reading of two of the three MSS and the third, C, tends to omit h before r. In Napier III, 22, l. 14, the phrase clearly means 'hurriedly, quickly', and, as this makes sense here, there is no reason to amend, with Sweet, to *rædinge* 'reading'.

¹⁹⁴⁻⁹⁹ An þeodpita . . . þingian ȝeorne : though only in E and I this passage seems to bear the marks of Wulfstan's style; cf. e.g. the description of the destruction and captivity of the Jews in Napier II 14, and the account of the flood ib. 10 : *ȝod to þam spyðe ȝeȝræmedon, þæt he let æt nehstan flod ȝan ofer ealne middaneard*. The expression, *clumiað mid ceafum þær hy sceoldan clypian*, is used in Napier XXXVII, in a part of it which may be by Wulfstan, and is repeated in XLI and in *Polity* 5.

¹⁹⁴ ȝildas : the author of the *Liber Querulus de Excidio Britanniae*, in 537, if 493 is the correct date of the battle at Mons Badonicus. Another view would put the year of this, which is also the year of Gildas's birth, 23 years later, and so date his book 560. It is a tirade against the crimes of his countrymen; Alcuin also used it to point the moral that the Viking raids were a punishment for the sins of the people (v. A. W. Haddan and W. Stubbs, *Councils and Ecclesiastical Documents* III. 510). Wulfstan may have taken his idea from this letter.

magan, *pret.pres.(5)*; mæg,
 3rd *pers.sg.pres.*; MAY, can
 61, 102, &c; mæge, *subj.sg.*
 71; magan, *pres.pl.* 176,
 182; *subj.pl.* 165; mæhte,
pl.sg. 177
 man, *m.monos-stem*, MAN¹ 4, 10,
 12, &c
 man, *indef.pron.* [MAN]; one,
 they 12, 13, &c
 mæn, *n.a-stem*, [MAN²]; evil
 deed, crime 173
 mǣndæd, *f.i-stem*, [MAN² +
 DEED]; crime 138
 manig, *adj. pron.* MANY;
 manege 14, 74, &c; mæn-
 ege, 43, 81, mænige 98, *pl.*
 mǣnslaga, *m.n-stem*, [MAN-
 SLAȜE]; manslayer, homi-
 cide 167
 mannsylen, *f.jō-stem*, selling of
 men (as slaves) 139

manslyht, *m.i-stem*, [MAN-
 SLAUGHT]; manslaughter 142
 mǣnswora, *m.n-stem*, [MAN-
 SWEAR]; perjurer 169
 mǣra, *adj., comp.* MORE 71, 97,
 102
 mǣgræs, *m.a-stem*, [MAY sb.²
 + RESE]; attack on kins-
 men 141
 mǣgslaga, *m.n-stem*, slayer of a
 kinsman 168
 mǣgū, *f.ō-stem*, [MAYTH]; kin-
 dred, family 107
 gemæne, *adj.* [I-MENE]; com-
 mon, universal 51, 106, 110,
 48; *gemænnum ceape*, as a joint
 purchase 89
 mænigfeald, *adj.* MANTFOLD,
 various 136, 193; mænig-
 fealdre, *comp.* 98

mǣrþ, *f.ō-stem*, glory 210
 mæsserbana, *m.n-stem*, [MAS-
 SER¹ + BANE¹]; slayer of a
 priest 168
 mǣst, *adj., superl.* MOST, great-
 est 74; mæst *adv.* almost
 everyone 69, 70
 mǣþ, *f.i-stem*, [METHE]; hon-
 our, respect 32, 84
 micel, *adj.* [MICKLE]; MUCH,
 great 18, 19, &c
 mid, *prep.w.dat.* [MID]; with,
 among 10, 17, &c
 milds, *f.jō-stem*, [MILCE]; mercy
 201
 misbēodan, *v.(2), w.dat.* [MIS-
 BEDE]; ill-use, injure 34
 misdæd, *f.i-stem*, MISDEED, sin
 137, 154, &c
 mislimpan, *v.(3), impers.w.dat.*
 go wrong 133
 mistlic, *adj.* [MISLICH]; various
 73, 143, 145, 169
 mōdor, *f.r-stem*, MOTHER 95
 morōdæd, *f.i-stem*, [MURTH¹ +
 DEED]; murder, deadly sin
 137
 morþorwyrhta, *m.n-stem*,
 [MURDER + WRIGHT¹]; mu-
 rderer 169
 mōt, *pret.pres.(6)*, [MOTE¹];
 may, must 16, 19, 48
 mund, *f.ō-stem*, [MUND]; se-
 curity, protection 32
 myltestre, *f.n-stem*, harlot 170
 mynsterhata, *m.n-stem*,
 [MINSTER +]; persecutor of
 monasteries 168
 myrhð, *f.ō-stem*, MIRTH, joy 210

b) To what extent is this translation of *Exodus* responsive to the textual and lexical ambiguities of the poem?

75 Hæfde wederwolcen widum fæðmum
eorðan ond uprodor efne gedæled,
lædde leodwerod, ligfyr adranc
hate heofontorht. Hæleð wafedon,
drihta gedrymost. Dægsceldes hleo
80 wand ofer wolcnum; hæfde witig God
sunnan siðfæt segle ofertolden,
swa þa mæstrapas men ne cuðon,
ne ða seglrode gescon meahton
eorðbuende ealle cræfte,
85 hu afæstnod was feldhusa mæst,
siððan He mid wuldre geweorðode
peodenholde. þa was þrida wic
folce to frofre. Fyrd eall geseah
hu þær hlifedon halige seglas,
90 lyftwundor leoht; leode ongeton,
dugoð Israhela, þæt þær Drihten cwom,
weroda Drihten, wicsteal metan.

Peter Lucas edition *Exodus*

The cloud in its wide embraces had truly divided earth and heaven; it guided the host. The flame was quenched, bright in its heat; the men were amazed, most joyful of multitudes. The shelter of the day-shield moved over the sky; wise God had covered the course of the sun with a sail,² though men, dwellers on earth, knew not the rigging, nor could behold the sail-yard by any skill, how the greatest of tents was made fast. After He had gloriously honoured the faithful ones, then came the third encampment as a solace to the people; all the army saw how the holy sails towered up there, bright marvel of the sky; the people, the host of Israelites, saw that the Lord, the God of hosts, came there to lay out the camp.

R.K.Gordon translation (1954)

c) What is revealed about the target audiences and aims of the editors of these two editions of *Ancrene Wisse*? You may wish to comment on the translation.

ah wult þu me bugge hire? buggen hire? oðer
wið oðer luue oðer wið sumhwæat elles. Me suleð wel lu
ue. ⁊ swa me ah to sulle luue. ⁊ for na þing elles. gef þin is
20 swa to sullen. Ich habbe iboht hire wið luue ouer alle opre.
for of þe fowr measte luuen. ich habbe icud toward te.
þe measte of ham alle. gef þu seist þu nult nawt leote
pron se liht chap. ah wult gette mare. nempne hwæt
hit schule beon. sete feor o þi luue. þu ne schalt seggen se
25 muchel. þu ich nule geoue mare. wult tu castles. kinedom
es. wult tu wealden al þe world? Ich chulle do þe betere. ma
kie þe wið al þis. cwen of heoueniche. þu schalt te seolf
beo seouewald brihtre þen þe sunne. nan uel ne schal
f. 108a nahhi þe. na wunne ne schal wonti þe. al þi wil schal beon i
wraht in heouene ⁊ eo in eorðe. ge ⁊ get in helle. ne schalnea
uer heorte penchen hwuch selhðe. þu ich nule geouen for þi
luue. unmeteliche. vneuenliche. unendeliche mare.

18, 19 me suleð wel luue: after this for luue is omitted.

f. 108a. On this page the lines are crowded and words written unusually close together. 5 weole written wule; first stroke of u altered to e, above second stroke a small o in paler ink. Correction probably by main hand. wule shows attraction of suse; cf. reverse in M. kresules weole.

J.R.R. Tolkien edition *Ancrene Wisse*

10 '3ef þi luue nis nawt to geouene, ah wult þet me bugge hire—
buggen hire? Hu? Oðer wið oðer luue oðer wið sumhwæt elles. Me
suleð wel luue for luue; ant swa me ah to sulle luue, ant for na þing
elles. 3ef þin is swa to sullen, Ich habbe iboht hire wið luue ouer alle
opre; for of þe fowr measte luuen Ich habbe icud toward te þe measte
15 of ham alle.

'3ef þu seist þu nult nawt leote þron se liht chap, ah wult zette
mare, nempne hwæt hit schule beon. Sete feor o þi luue; þu ne schalt
seggen se muchel þet Ich nule geoue mare. Wult tu castles,
kinedomes, wult tu wealden al þe world? Ich chulle do þe betere—
20 makie þe wið al þis cwen of heoueniche. Pu schalt te seolf beo
seouewald brihtre þen þe sunne. Nan uel ne schal | nahhi þe, na
wunne ne schal wonti þe. Al þi wil schal beon iwraht in heouene ant ec
in eorðe—3e, ant 3et in helle. Ne schal neauer heorte penchen
swuch selhðe þet Ich nule geouen for þi luue unmeteliche,
25 vneuenliche, unendeliche mare.

11 buggen hire? Hu? CG, buggen hire? A, achatez-le. Coment? F, quomodo potest
emi? L, do seie hwi N, dites coment vus la uolez doner S, hu? T 12 for luue]
CFGNTSLP, om. A 24 swuch] CGNT, hwuch A 36 þer] CFGNTSL, om.
A, þe P

'If your love is not to be given, but you want it to be bought, how is it
to be bought? Either with another love or with something else. Love for
love is a fair exchange; and that is how love should be sold, and for
nothing else. If your love is to be sold in this way, I have bought it with
a love greater than all others; since, of the four greatest loves, I have
shown towards you the greatest of them all.

'If you say that you do not want to value your love so cheaply, but
want still more, say what it is to be. Set a price on your love; you cannot
ask so much that I will not give more. Do you want castles, kingdoms,
do you want to have power over the whole world? I will do better for
[108] you—make you, as well as all this, queen of the kingdom of heaven.
You yourself shall be seven times brighter than the sun. No evil shall
approach you, no joy shall fail you. All your will shall be done in heaven
and on earth—yes, and even in hell. No heart can ever imagine such
bliss that I will not give for your love immeasurably, incomparably,
infinitely more.

d) Evaluate the relative merits and shortcomings of the editorial choices made in these two editions of *Sir Orfeo*

AUCHINLECK

Pai made scheltrom in ich a side,
 & sayd pai wold pere abide
 & dye per euerichon,
 Er þe quen schuld fram hem gon; 190
 Ac þete amiddes hem ful riȝt
 Þe quen was oway y-twiȝt,
 Wiþ fairi forþ y-nome
 — Men wist neuer wher sche was bicomē.
 Þo was per criȝing, wepe & wo; 195
 Þe king into his chaumber is go,
 & oft swoned opon þe ston,
 & made swiche diol & swiche mon
 þat neiȝe his liif was y-spent
 — Per was non amendement. 200

He cleped to-gider his barouns,
 Erls, lordes of renouns,
 & when pai al y-comen were,
 'Lordinges,' he said, 'Bifor þou here 205
 Ich ordainy min heiȝe steward
 To wite mi kingdom afterward;
 In mi stede ben he schal
 To kepe mi londes ouer-al,
 For now ichaue mi quen y-lore,
 Þe fairest leuedi þat euer was bore, 210

ASHMOLE 61

And seyde he wold per a-byde
 What auentour so be-tyde;
 Lyue & dyȝe þei wold jchon,
 Or þat þe quen schuld fro þem gon; 190
 Than þei gon batell to make,
 And sched blod for hys quenys sake,
 Bot among þem all-ryȝt
 The quen was a-wey twyȝt,
 And wyth þe feyry a-wey j-nome 195
 — The ne wist wer sche was com.
 Ther was cry, wepyng & wo;
 The kyng vnto hys chamber þede þo,
 And oft he knelyd omne þe ston,
 And made grete sorow for sche was gon, 200
 That né hys lyue was j-spent
 — Bot per myȝt be non amendement.
 He sent after hys barons,
 Hknyȝhtys, squyres off grete renownys;
 When þei all com were 205
 He seyde, 'Lordingys, be-for þou here
 I wold orden my hyȝe stuerd f. 153a
 To kepe my londys afterward,
 And in my sted be he schalle,
 To kepe my landys ouer-alle. 210
 When þat þe se my lyffe is spent,
 Than make þou a parlament;

200 grete] gre MS.

206 Lordingys] lodingys MS.

HARLEY 3810

Per made þey watche on euery syde,
 & cast hem pere for to byde
 & suffre deth euery-chon, 185
 Er sche schulde from hem gon;
 And pere anon, with-outen lette, f. 4b
 Among hem all scho was yfet;
 Away with þe fayré sche was ynome
 — Wist non of hem where sche become. 190
 Þen was per wepyng & cryeng also;
 Þe kyng to his chamber can go,
 & fel adown on þe stone;
 He made grete dele & meche mone;
 Wel nye he hed hym-self y-schent 195
 — He syȝ þer was non amendement.
 He sende aftur erle and baroun
 & oþer lordys of grete renoun,
 And whan þey to-gedur were,
 'Lordys,' he seyde, 'þat ben here, 200
 Y ordeyne my steward of myn halle
 To kepe my londys oueralle;
 Now y haue my quene for-lore,
 Þe best lady þat euer was bore,

	Thai made scheltrom° in° ich a side,	<i>a shield-wall / on</i>
	And sayd thai wold° there abide	<i>would</i>
	And dye ther, everichon,°	<i>everyone</i>
190	Er° the Quen schuld° fram hern° gon—	<i>Before / should / them</i>
	Ac yete amiddes hern ful right	
	The Quen was oway y-tvight,°	<i>snatched</i>
	With° fairi° forth y-nome;	<i>By / faerie, enchantment</i>
	Men wist° never wher sche was bicomē.	<i>knew</i>
195	Tho was ther criing, wepe° and wol°	<i>weeping / woe, sorrow</i>
	The King into his chaumber is go,	
	And oft swoned° opōn the ston°	<i>swooned / stone (floor)</i>
	And made swiche° diol° and swiche mon°	<i>such / grief / moan</i>
	That neighe his liif was y-spent—	
200	Ther was non amendement. ⁸	
	He cleped° togider his barouns,	<i>called</i>
	Erls, lordes of renouns,°	<i>renown</i>
	And when thai al y-comen were,	
	“Lordinges,”° he said, “bifor you here	<i>Lords, Sirs</i>
205	Ich ordainy min Heighe° Steward°	<i>High</i>
	To wite° mi kingdom afterward.°	<i>watch over / hereafter</i>
	In mi stede° ben he schal	<i>stead</i>
	To kepe° mi londes° overal—	<i>protect / lands</i>
	For now° Ichave° mi Quen y-lore,	<i>now (that) / I have</i>
210	The fairest levedi that ever was bore,	

5. And if you cause us hindrance.

6. Such that nothing will help you.

7. It would be preferable to me to forfeit my own life.

8. Such that his life was nearly expended—there was no remedy (for it).

9. On the occupation of steward, see *Ywain and Gawain*, l. 1209, n.

2. Answer ONE of the following:

- a) 'Some textual theorists have argued that the desire to recover the authorial text, the original composition, should be significantly de-emphasised as a goal of editing' (DOUGLAS MOFFAT and VINCENT P.McCARREN). Debate the issues.
- b) Consider the relative value of THREE of the following editing methods: direct; recensionist; best text; parallel text.
- c) 'In a hypertext system, the electronic text becomes one element in an electronically replicated cultural context that, in theory at least, may be as open-ended as the real-world context on which it is modeled' (PETER S.BAKER). Discuss the contribution of electronic editions to textual criticism in light of this remark.
- d) 'The dialectic that is textual criticism feeds on shifting binaries whereby the roles of text and gloss are continually reversed and interrogated' (DAVID C. GREETHAM). Discuss
- e) By what means can the practice of editing best recover historical and cultural conditions of textual production?