

2407

SECOND PUBLIC EXAMINATION

HONOUR SCHOOL OF ENGLISH LANGUAGE AND LITERATURE

COURSE II

A4 Introduction to Textual Criticism

TRINITY TERM 2012

Thursday, 24 May, 9.30 am – 12.45 pm

Time allowed – Three hours plus fifteen minutes reading time

Answer BOTH questions 1 and 2.

You may write on the same text in more than one answer, but you should not repeat material. You should pay careful attention in your answers to the precise terms of the quotations and questions.

Do *not* turn over until told to do so

1. Choose THREE of the passages (a) to (d).

(a) Comment on the different editorial practices in these extracts from two editions of *Exodus*.

Ða ic on morgen gefrægn modes rofan
 hebban herebyman hludan stefnum,
 100 wuldres woman. Werod eall aras,
 modigra mægen, swa him Moyses bebead,
 mære magoræswa, Metodes folce.
 Fus fyrdgetrum forð gesawon
 lifes latþeow lyftweg metan.
 105 Segl siðe weold; sæmen æfter
 foron flodwege. Folc wæs on salum,
 107 hlud herges cyrm. Heofonbeacen astah;
 125 scean scir werod, scyldas lixton.
 Gesawon randwigan rihte stræte,
 segn ofer sweotum, oð þæt sæfæsten
 landes æt ende leodmægne forstod,
 fus on forðweg. Fyrdwic aras.

105. segl *Bouterwek*²] swegl *MS* 107 P. 148
 begins with LUD and space for large init. cap., h in margin herges] heriges
 MS, with i expuncted
 127 sweotum] -on *MS* 128 leodmægne *Thorpe*] leo/mægne *MS*

Exodus - text, translation and commentary J.R.R. Tolkien, ed. Joan Turville-Petre (1981)

- 100 þā ic on morgen gefrægn mōdes rōfan
 hebban herebȳman hlūdan stefnum,
 wuldres wōman. Werod ƿall ārās,
 mōðigra mægēti; swā him Moyses bebēad;
 mære magorāswa, Metodes folce,
 fūs fyrðgetrum. Forð gesāwon
 lifes lātpēow lifweg metan;
 105 segl siðe wēold, sāmen æfter
 fōron flōdwege. Folc wæs on sālum,
 [H]LŪD heriges cyrm. Heofonbēacen āstāh
 æfen[n]a gehwām, oðer wundor,
 syllic, æfter sunnan setlrade behēold,
 110 ofer lēodwerum lige scīnan,
 byrnende bēam. Blāce stōdon
 ofer scēotendum scīre lēoman,
 scinon scyldhrēoðan, sceado swiðredon;
 nēowle nihtscuwan nēah ne mihton
 115 heolstor āhȳdan. Heofoncandel barn;
 nīwe nihtweard nȳde sceolde
 wīcian ofer weredum, þȳ lās him wēstengryre,
 hār hǣð[brōga], holmegum wederum
 o[n] fērclamme ferhð getwǣf[de].
 120 Hǣfde foregenga fȳrene loccas,
 blāce bēamas, bālegsan hwēop
 in þām hereprēate, hātan lige,
 þæt hē on wēstenne werod forbærnde,
 nymðe hīe mōdhwate Moyses hȳrde.
 125 Sceān scīrwerod; scyldas fixton,
 gesāwon randwigan rihte strāte,
 segn ofer swēoton, oðþæt sǣfasten
 landes æt ende lēo[d]mægne forstōd,
 fūs on forðweg. Fyrðwīc ārās;

96 Begins p. 147

104 lātpēow: lāttēow. Se

lifweg: lifweg (i.e. lyftweg) Diet, Gr, Klu, Wlk, Se; lifweg or lidweg Bouz

105 segl: MS swegl; em. Bouz, Gr, Wlk, Se; cf. 81

106 flōdwege: foldwege? Gr

sālum is the last word on p. 147

107 LUD, with a small h added in the margin, begins p. 148; space is left for a large capital

heriges: a dot appears in the MS under the i

108 æfen[n]a: MS æfena; em. Graz, Mrk

109 sunnan: sunne Br, Kr

behēold: behēoldon Bouz, Goll lxx; ongann? Nap

setlrade: seglrad Se MLR

110 lige scīnan: liges scīman? Cos

113 sceado: MS sceado, so Bl (n.); em. Th (n.), Edd

swiðredon: sweðredon Se

115 heolstor: heol(u)stras? Cos

barn: bearn Klu

118 hār hǣð[brōga]: so Cos, Kr; MS har hǣð; hāres hǣðes Sievz, Klu, Mrk, Se; hāre hǣðe Graz; hār hǣðstapa Rieger ("Verskunst," p. 46), Br

119 o[n] fērclamme: MS ofer clamme; fārclamme Diet; ð fērclamme Gr, Wlk, Bl; on fērclamme Klu, Kr; on fārclamme Se

getwǣf[de]: MS getwaf; em. Th, Edd

121 bālegsan: MS befl egsan; so Th ('cry of dread'), Bou; bālegsan Bouz, Gr; bālegetan Se; bālegetan Wlk, Kr

hwēop: spēaw Bouz

122 in: omitted by Gr

124 hȳrde: hȳrden? Klu; hȳrden Nap, Brz; see Note

125 sceān scīrwerod: sceān scīr werod Edd; sceān on scīr werod Bouz

126 rihte: rihtre Gr

127 swēoton: swēotum Bou, Gr, Graz, Mrk

128 lēo[d]mægne: MS leo mægne; em. Edd; lēode mægne? Bl (n.)

129 fūs on forðweg: fūsne forðweg Bouz; fūse on forðweg Mrk; fūson (i.e. fūsum) forðweg Klacber (ES: 41:110), Nap

Irving, E.B. (ed.), *Exodus* (1953)

(b) Consider Richard Marsden's editorial practice in this extract from his edition of Wulfstan's *Sermo Lupi ad Anglos*, including the linguistic and explanatory notes.

Forþām hit is on ūs callum swutol° and gesēne° þæt wē ær þysan oftor°
 brācan° þonne wē bēttan° and þy° is þysse þēode fela onsāge°. Ne dohte
 hit° nū lange inne ne ūte ac wæs here° and hunger, bryne and blōdgyte°, on
 45 gewelhwylcan° ende° oft and gelōme°. And ūs stalu° and cwalu°, 'stric' and
 steorfa°, orfwealm° and uncōpu°, hōl° and hete°, and rýpera° rēaflic° 'derede°'
 swýþe þearle; and ūs ungylda° swýðe gedrehtan° and ūs unwedera° foroft°
 wēoldan° unwæstma°. Forþām on þysan earde wæs, 'swā hit þincan mæg', nū
 fela gēara unrihta fela and tealte° getrýwða° æghwær mid mannum. Ne bearn°
 50 nū foroft gesib° gesibban 'þē mā þe' fremdan, ne fæder his bearne, ne hwilum°
 bearn his āgenum fæder, ne brōþor ðōþrum. Ne° ūre° ænig his lif fadode° swā swā
 hē scolde, 'ne gehādode regollice, ne' lāwede° lahlice°, ac worhtan° lust ūs° tō
 lage ealles tō gelōme and nāþor° ne hēoldan ne lāre ne lage Godes ne manna
 swā swā wē scoldan. Ne ænig wið° oþerne getrýwlice° þōhte° swā rihte swā hē
 55 scolde ac mæst° ælc° swicode° and ðōþrum derede 'wordes and dæde', and hūru
 unrihtlice mæst° ælc° oþerne æftan° hēawep° mid sceandlican° onscytan°: 'dō
 mære gif hē mæge'. Forþām hēr syn on lande ungetrýwpa° micle for° Gode and
 for worolde and ēac hēr syn on earde on mistlice° wisan hlāfordswican° manege,
 and 'ealra mæst hlāfordswice se bið' on worolde þæt° man his hlāfordes sāule°
 60 beswice. And ful micel hlāfordswice ēac bið on worolde þæt man his hlāford
 'of life forræde' oððon° of lande lifendne° drife, and ægþer° is geworden° on
 þysan earde. 'Eadweard' man forrædde and syððan ācwealde° and æfter þām
 forbærnde° 'and Æþelrēd man dræfde ūt of his earde'. And godsibbas° and
 godbearn° tō fela man forspilde° wīde gynd þās þēode, 'tōēacan° oðran ealles
 65 tō manegan þe man unscyldegige° forfōr° ealles tō wīde'. And ealles tō manege
 hālige stōwa° wīde forwurdan° 'þurh þæt þe man sume men ær þām gelōgode
 swā man nā ne scolde' gif man on° Godes griðe° mæþe° witan° wolde. And
 crīstenes folces tō fela man gescalde ūt of þysan earde nū ealle hwīle. And eal
 þæt is Gode lāð°, gelyfe° sē þe wille.

42 clear evident more often 43 transgressed amended therefore 44 devastation
 bloodshed 45 nearly every region theft murder 46 pestilence cattle-plague disease
 malice hatred robbers *gp* plundering harmed 47 excessive taxes oppressed bad weather
 very often 48 caused +*g* crop failures 49 wavering loyalties protects +*d*
 50 kinsman sometimes 51 Nor of us regulated 52 lay people according to the law
 (we) have made for us 53 neither 54 towards loyally has intended 55 almost
 everyone has betrayed 56 in the back stabs shameful attacks 57 disloyalties towards
 58 various traitors to their lords
 59 (is) that soul 61 or living both happened 62 killed 63 burned godfathers *ap*
 64 godchildren *ap* killed besides +*d* 65 guildless destroyed 66 places *ap* fell to
 ruin 67 to sanctuary respect, show

43–4 is *þysse þēode fela onsāge* 'much is assailing this nation'; the adj. *onsāge* takes the dat. *Ne dohte hit* 'It has not availed', i.e. 'Things have not thrived (or prospered)'.

45 *oft and gelōme* 'often and frequently', or perhaps, 'over and over again'; a favourite tautologous phr. of Wulfstan's (to be repeated four times). *strie* This word occurs only in Wulfstan's writings and presumably refers to some sort of 'sickness' or 'plague', but the specific meaning scarcely matters here.

46 *derede* A sg. vb., perhaps, because each individual item in the long list is sg.; it takes a dat. obj. (*ūs*).

48 *swā hit þincan mæg* 'so it might be thought'.

50 *þē mā þe instr. phr.*: 'any more than'.

52 *ne gehādode regollice*, *ne* 'neither those in holy orders [lit. "those consecrated", past part. as noun] according to the rule [lit. "regularly"], nor...'. The 'rule' referred to is the Rule of St Benedict, a form of which was followed by English monks in Wulfstan's time.

55 *wordes and dæde* gen. of respect: 'in word and deed'; see also 107.

56–7 *dō māre gif hē mæge* An ironical flourish: 'let him do more if he can [sbj.]'. Similar phrs. occur in 69, 81, etc.

59 *ealra mæst hlāfordswice se bið* The adj. *mæst* describes *hlāfordswice*; *ealra* is a pron.: 'the greatest treachery of all that there is to a lord'.

61 *of life forræde* 'betray from life', i.e. 'kill treacherously'.

62 *Ēadweard* Edward the Martyr succeeded his father Edgar in 975 and was murdered at Corfe Gap, Dorset, in 978; his half-brother Æthelred, who took the throne, was implicated.

63 and *Æpelrēd* ... *earde* Three copies of the sermon, including that in Hatton 113, om. this sentence, perhaps for diplomatic reasons, because they were made during the reign of Cnut (1016–35), whose father it was (Svein) who caused Æthelred to flee to Normandy in 1013. See 8/headnote.

64–5 *tōēacan* ... *tō wīde* These words have been added in the margin of the manuscript (i.e. Cotton Nero A. i) in a contemporary hand; they are in the other manuscripts.

66–7 *þurh þæt þe* 'through this, that', i.e. 'for the reason that'. *man sume men* ... *ne scolde* 'someone previously placed (*gelōgode*) certain men (there [i.e. in the *halige stōwa*, "monasteries"]) as they should never have (done)'. The unsuitable men were probably so-called 'secular' canons or other non-Benedictines.

72 *āne cwēnan* ... *gemæne* 'buy a woman in common (*gemæne*) as a joint (*gemænnum*) purchase'.

75 *Godes gesceafte* 'God's creature'; i.e. the woman, obj. of *syllað*. God sacrificed his son to 'buy' redemption for humankind.

(c) Provide a comparative appraisal of these two translations of *Ancrene Wisse*, both based on Cambridge, Corpus Christi MS 402 (Hasenfratz's edition of the Middle English is provided for reference).

Godd haveth ofgan ure luve on alle cunne wise. He haveth muchel i-don us, ant mare bihaten. Muchel yeove ofdraheth luve. Me al the world he yef us in Adam, ure alde feader, ant al thet is i the world he weorp under ure fet, beastes ant fuheles, ear we weren forgulte. *Omnia subiecisti sub pedibus ejus, oves et boves universas insuper et pecora campi, volucres celi, et pisces maris, qui perambulant semitas maris.* Ant yet al thet is, as is th'ruppe i-seid, serveth the gode to sawle biheve, yet te uvele servith eorthe, sea, ant sunne. He dude yet mare, yef us nawt ane of his, ah dude al him-seolven. Se heh yeove nes neaver i-yeven to se lahe wrecches. *Apostolus: Christus dilexit ecclesiam et dedit semet ipsum pro ea.* "Crist," seith Seinte Pawel, "luvede swa his leofmon thet he yef for hire the pris of him-seolven." Neometh nu gode yeme, mine leove sustren, for-hwi me ah him to luvien. Earst as a mon the woheth, as a king thet luvede a gentil povre leafdi of feorrene londe, he sende his sonden bivoren - thet weren the patriarches ant te proph[et]es of the alde testament - with leattres i-sealet. On ende he com him-seolven ant brohte the Godspel as leattres i-openet ant wrat with his ahne blod saluz to his leofmon, luve-gretunge, for-te wohin hire with ant hire luve wealden. Her-to falleth a tale, a wrihe forbisne.

Hasenfratz, R. (ed.), *Ancrene Wisse* (2000)

2. God has earned our love in every kind of way. He has done much for us, and promised more. A generous gift attracts love. Why, he gave us the whole world through Adam, our ancestor; and everything that is in the world, animals and birds, he cast under our feet, before we fell through sin. *You have put all things under his feet: all sheep and cattle, and in addition the beasts of the field, the birds of the air, and the fish of the sea that travel the paths of the sea.*¹² And everything that exists, as has been said above, still serves the virtuous for the good of their souls. Even the wicked are served by the sea, earth, and sun.¹³ He did still more: not only gave us what was his, but gave himself completely. Such a noble gift was never given to such base wretches. *The Apostle: Christ loved the Church and gave himself for it.*¹⁴ Christ, says St Paul, loved his beloved¹⁵ so much that he gave the price of himself for her. Now note carefully, my dear sisters, why he ought to be loved. First, like a suitor, like a king who was in love with an impoverished noble¹⁶ lady in a distant land, he sent ahead his messengers, the patriarchs and prophets of the Old Testament, with sealed letters. At last he came himself, and brought the Gospel as open letters;¹⁶ and with his own blood wrote greetings to his lady,¹⁷ a lover's homage to woo her with and gain her love. There is a story linked with this; an exemplary tale with a hidden meaning.¹⁸

After 'beloved', F has 'that is, Holy Church'.

7. 12 *You have put all things ... paths of the sea:* Ps. 8: 8–9.

7. 13 *Even the wicked ... sun:* Shepherd [1959], p. 54, compares Matt. 5: 45: we should love our enemies and do good to those who hate us, as our Father in heaven 'makes his sun rise on good and bad, and rains on the just and the unjust.'

7. 14 *Christ ... gave himself for it:* Eph. 5: 25.

7. 15 *impoverished noble:* in AL only.

7. 16 *sealed letters (...) open letters:* the imagery is taken from different types of royal letters, the *litterae clausae* ('letters close') addressed to individuals, which were closed and sealed on the outside, and *litterae patentes* ('letters patent'), which were open charters with a seal attached to the foot (see further Shepherd [1959], p. 55). The Old Testament, which could be read allegorically as prefiguring the events and teaching of the New Testament (see Smalley, pp. 6–14), is seen as a 'closed' text requiring interpretation, the New Testament as more directly accessible.

7. 17 *with his own blood ... lady:* i.e. demonstrated his love for humanity through the Passion.

7. 18 *There is a story ... meaning:* the allegorized *exemplum* that follows was popular in both Latin sermons and vernacular literature in the later Middle Ages; see the thorough survey in Gaffney [1931], and also Woolf [1962], and Woolf [1968], pp. 44–57. The version in *AW* is the earliest recorded instance, but the analogues in thirteenth-century Paris sermons suggest a common Continental origin. Innes-Parker discusses its possible reception by its female readers.

Millett, B. (ed. and trans.), *Ancrene Wisse – Guide for anchoresses* (2009)

God has deserved our love in every way. He has done much for us, and promised more. A great gift draws out love. But He gave to us, in the person of our first father Adam, the whole world; and all that is in the world, beasts and birds, He cast beneath our feet, before we sinned. *Thou hast subjected all things under his feet, all sheep and oxen, moreover the beasts also of the fields. The birds of the air and the fishes of the sea that pass through the paths of the sea.*⁴ All that exists, as has been said above, is used by the good for the profit of the soul, but the wicked use earth and sea and sun for their own ends. He did still more. He not only gave us of His possessions, but gave us the whole of Himself. Never was so noble a gift given to such ignoble creatures. *Christ loved the church, says the Apostle, and delivered himself up for it.*¹ Christ, he says, so loved His beloved that for her He gave the price of Himself. Now attend carefully, my dear sisters, to the reason why He should be loved. At first, like a man seeking love, like a king who loved a lady of a far country, who was noble and yet poor, He sent His messengers before Him with sealed letters—the patriarchs and prophets of the Old Testament. Then at last He came Himself and brought the Gospel, open letters, as it were, and with His own blood wrote greetings to His beloved, greetings of love to seek and win her own. There is a story which bears on this, a parable with hidden meaning.

⁴ Ps. viii. 8, 9.

¹ Eph. v. 25.



² *cordene castel*, a castle with earthworks. It is possible that the word *cordene* is meant to evoke the earthly state of the soul, cf. the soul's "two houses", p. 167.

Salu, M.B. (ed and trans.), *Ancrene Riwe* (1955)

(d) Comment on the differences between these two editions of the Auchinleck *Sir Orfeo*.

25	Orfeo was a ryche king, In Ingland an heighe ^o lording, A stalworth ^o man and hardi bo, ^o Large and curteys ^o he was also. His fader was comen of ^o King Pluto,	noble stalwart hardi bo bold as well Large . . . Generous and courteous from
30	And his moder of King Juno, That sum time were as godes y-hold ^o For aventours that thai dede and told. Orpheo most of ony thing Lovede the gle ^o of harpyng.	considered minstrelsy Sure
35	Syker ^o was every gode harpure Of hym to have moche honour. Hymself loved for to harpe, And layde ther-on his wittes scharpe. He lerned so, ther nothing ^o was	not at all place
40	A better harper in no plas. ^o In the world was never man born That onus ^o Orpheo sat byforn, And ^o he myght of his harpyng her, ^o He schulde ^o thinke that he wer	ever If hear He schulde Who would not
45	In one of the joys of paradys, Suche joy and melody in his harpyng is. This king sojourned in Traciens, That was a cite ^o of noble defens. ^o (For Winchester was cleped tho ^o	fortification cleped tho called then
50	Traciens withouten no. ^o) The king hadde a quen of priis ^o That was y-cleped Dame Heurodis, The fairest levedi ^o for the nones ^o That might gon ^o on bodi and bones,	denial excellence lady while walk
55	Ful of love and of gōdenisse; Ac ^o no man may telle hir fairnise.	But

Dunn, C.W. and Byrnes, E.T. (eds.), *Middle English Literature* (1973, revd. 1990)

25 ¶ Orfeo was a king, {f.300ra} 
 In Ingland an heiȝe lording,
 A stalworþ man & hardi bo,  A: MS has a T, but underdotted.
 Large & curteys he was also.
 His fader was comen of king Pluto
 30 & his moder of king Juno
 þat sum time were as godes yhold
 For auentours þat þai dede & told.

 35

 40

 45

 þis king soiournd in Traciens
 þat was a cite of noble defens;
 For Winchester was cleped þo
 50 Traciens wiþouten no.
 ¶ þe king hadde a quen of priis
 þat was ycleped dame Herodis,
 þe fairest leuedi for þe nones
 þat miȝt gon on bodi & bones,
 55 Ful of loue & of godenisse,
 Ac no mañ may telle hir fairnise.

2. Answer ONE of the following:

- (a) 'The fully authoritative text is . . . always one which has been socially produced; as a result, the critical standard for what constitutes authoritativeness cannot rest with the author and his intentions alone.' (JEROME J. MCGANN) Discuss.
- (b) 'It is the experience of most if not all textual critics that scribes tend to simplify the text they are copying.' (NICOLAS JACOBS) Have you found this to be the case?
- (c) Discuss the significance of the manuscript context of ONE OR MORE medieval text(s).
- (d) 'Given the hard choices that editors must confront, little unconscious shoves and nudges may lead them to tilt just a bit, to base a textual decision on political correctness, or theological correctness, or (now and then, I hope) aesthetic correctness.' (EDWARD B. IRVING, JR) Consider the implications of this statement.
- (e) 'Unlike printed books, electronic texts lend themselves to sophisticated searches, concordancing, collations, and other forms of text retrieval.' (THE SOCIETY FOR EARLY ENGLISH AND OLD NORSE ELECTRONIC EDITIONS, HOMEPAGE) Write an essay comparing printed and electronic editions of ONE OR MORE medieval text(s).