

**SECOND PUBLIC EXAMINATION**

---

**HONOUR SCHOOL OF ENGLISH LANGUAGE AND LITERATURE**

**COURSE II**

**A4 Introduction to Textual Criticism**

---

**TRINITY TERM 2011**

**Thursday, 2 June, 9.15 am – 12.30 pm**

**Time allowed – Three hours plus fifteen minutes reading time**

---

**Answer BOTH questions 1 and 2.**

**You may write on the same text in more than one answer, but you should not repeat material. You should pay careful attention in your answers to the precise terms of the quotations and questions.**

***Do not* turn over until told to do so**

Answer BOTH questions

You may write on the same text in more than one answer, but you should not repeat material. You should pay careful attention in your answers to the precise terms of the quotations and questions.

1. Choose THREE of the passages (a) to (d)

(a) Compare these two extracts from editions of *Exodus*, in particular their decisions about layout, presentation of the text and translation.

CÆDMON'S PARAPHRASE.

fúr fýrð-geþam.	Prompt that marshal band
forð geþam.	saw onward
lifer lat-þeop.	<i>the</i> Guide of life
lif-þez metan.	mete out life's way,
fpezl-frðe peolb.	10 <i>he the</i> sail's course directed.
fæ-men æfter.	<i>The</i> seamen after
fóron flób-þeze.	marched <i>the</i> flood way,
folc þær on falam.	<i>the</i> folk prospered.

XLIII.

XLIII.

Þlúb heþer cým.	[ 148 ] Loud was <i>the</i> shout of <i>the</i> host,
heopon-beacen aytán.	<i>the</i> heavenly beacon rose
æþena zeþam.	each evening.
oðer punþor fýlhc.	Another stupendous wonder !—
æfter funnan.	After <i>the</i> sun's
fetl-þábe beheolb.	setting course, <i>they</i> beheld
ofer leob-þeþum.	20 over <i>the</i> people,
líge fcinan.	a flame to shine,
býrnenbe beám.	a burning pillar ;
bláce fteþon.	pale stood
ofer fceotenþumi.	over <i>the</i> archers
fctne leoman.	<i>the</i> clear beams,
fcmón fcyld-hþeoðan <sup>a</sup> .	<i>the</i> bucklers shone.
fceaðo <sup>b</sup> ffrðnebon.	<i>The</i> shades prevailed ;
neople niht-fcupan.	yet <i>the</i> falling nightly shadows
neah ne mihton.	might not near
heolftor ahýðan.	30 shroud <i>the</i> gloom.
heopon-candel þapn.	<i>The</i> heavenly candle burnt,

<sup>a</sup> fcyld-hþeoðan. I am unable to translate the latter part of this compound.

<sup>b</sup> Perhaps we ought to read fceabo. I am aware that my translation of this and the three following lines is far from satisfactory.

nipe niht-þearb.	<i>the</i> new night-ward
nýbe fceolbe.	must by compulsion
þician ofer þeþeþum.	rest over <i>the</i> hosts,
þý lær hum þeýten-þnýpe.	lest them horror of <i>the</i> waste,
hár hæð <sup>a</sup> .	<i>the</i> hoar heath
holmeþum þeþeþum.	with <i>its</i> raging storms,
oferclamme.	should overwhelm,
feþhð geþæf.	<i>their</i> souls fail.

<sup>a</sup> This line is incomplete, and between l. 7. and l. 8. there is no alliteration ; indeed this part of the MS. is in general written with far less accuracy than the preceding.

*Cædmon's Metrical Paraphrase of Parts of the Holy Scriptures in Anglo-Saxon*, ed. and trans. Benjamin Thorpe (London: Society of Antiquaries, 1832)

## EXODUS

105        fus fyrdgettrum.    Forð gesawon  
              lifes latpeow    lifweg metan.  
              Segl siðe weold,    sæmen æfter  
              foron flodwege.    Folc wæs on salum,  
              hlud herges cyrm.    Heofonbeacen astah  
              æfena gehwam,    oðer wundor;  
 110        syllic æfter sunnan    setlrade beheold,  
              ofer leodwerum    lige scinan,  
              byrnende beam.    Blace stodon  
              ofer sceotendum    scire leoman,  
              scinon scyldhreoðan.    Sceado swiðredon,  
              neowle nihtscuwan    neah ne mihton  
 115        heolstor ahydan.    Heofoncandel barn;  
              niwe nihtweard    nyde sceolde  
              wician ofer weredum,    þy læs him westengryre,  
              har hæðbroga,    holmegum wederum  
              on ferclamme    ferhð getwæfde.

105        an eager force of warriors. In front they saw  
              their life's guide mark out the way of life.  
              The sail controlled the journey, the sailors travelled  
              the road of the sea after it. The people were joyful,  
              the clamour of the army loud. The heavenly beacon rose up  
              every evening, this the other miracle;  
 110        glorious after the sun's setting it remained,  
              shining with fire over the people,  
              a burning pillar. Bright rays shone  
              above the warriors, a gleaming ray of light,  
              so that their shields shone. Shadows melted away,  
 115        the low-lying night shadows near by could not  
              conceal their hiding place. The heavenly candle burned;<sup>11</sup>  
              it was necessary for this new night-guardian  
              to stay above the troops, in case the terror of the desert,  
              the grey heath-terror, might put an end to  
              life with the sudden terrifying grasp of the storms of the seas.

11 A possible allegorical allusion to the paschal candle lit on Holy Saturday when the new members of the church were baptised.

(b) Analyse Dorothy Whitelock's editorial aims and assumptions in this extract from her edition of Wulfstan's *Sermo Lupi ad Anglos*. A facsimile of London, British Library MS Cotton Nero A.i, fol. 110r is provided for comparative purposes.

#### A NOTE ON THE TEXT AND TEXTUAL NOTES

The punctuation and the use of capitals is modern. The abbreviations expanded are ~ over a vowel to represent a following *m*, *þ* for *pæt*, *æft* for *æfter*, *þon* for *þonne*, *xþ* for *crist*, and occasionally *m* for *men*. The Latin abbreviations in the rubric have also been expanded. In order to make it possible for the student to see the relation of the MSS, and the significant variants, I have given only a minimum of textual notes, ignoring unimportant differences in forms and spellings. All these differences can be consulted in Napier's and Bethurum's editions.

SERMO LUPI AD ANGLOS QUANDO DANI MAXIME PER-  
SECUTI SUNT EOS, QUOD FUIT ANNO MILLESIMO XIII  
AB INCARNATIONE DOMINI NOSTRI IESU CRISTI

Leofan men, gecnapað þæt soð is: ðeos porold is on ofste, 7 hit nealæcð þam ende, 7 þy hit is on porolde áá spa leng spá pyrse, 7 spa hit sceal nyde for folces synnan ær Antecristes tocyne yfelian spyþe, 7 huru hit pyrð þænne egeslic 7 grimlic pide on porolde. Understandað eac

TEXTUAL VARIANTS: <sup>1</sup> The rubric in C is identical, except that it has VIII for XIII and that QUOD has been corrected from QUOS. E replaces ANNO . . . CRISTI by IN DIES AÐELREDI REGIS, to which Anno Chri. 1009 has been added in a late, probably seventeenth-century, hand. B has as rubric only LAR SPELL, and H SERMO. <sup>2</sup> C, B and H omit for folces synnan; after synnan E adds fram dæge to dæge. <sup>3</sup> After spyþe C adds þis pæs on Aþelredes cyninzes dægem gedihl, þeoper geara fæce ær he forðferde. Jims se ðe pille hu hit þa pære 7 hþæt siððan gepurde. <sup>4</sup> C, B and H omit 7 huru . . . pide on porolde. <sup>5</sup> E adds ð (the abbreviation for Leofan men) before Understandað.

(Italicized figures refer to the textual variants)

<sup>1-4</sup> ðeos porold . . . pide on porolde; this passage is made up of phrases almost identical with some in the eschatological sermons, Napier XII, XIII, XV and XL. See especially Napier 79.12 f, 81.7 f, 83.10 ff, 189.5 f. These homilies contain some of the phrases which in our text occur in E and I only, or in E alone, e.g. fram dæge to dæge Napier 79.12, for folces synnan ibid. 81.8. The passage ibid. 189.7 f, for þam ðe heo (ðeos porold) is on ofsthum 7 hit nealæcð þam ende 7 þi heo pære purde þæt hi 7 ænig man ne lufode, shows that the first hit in l. 5 is better taken as a formal subject than as a false concord with the feminine noun porold.

<sup>5</sup> spa leng spá pyrse: cf (pæox) spa leng spa spyðor, which is Ælfric's rendering of Ex xix. 19, paulatim (cresebat) in maius.

<sup>6</sup> On Antichrist see Hastings, *Dictionary of the Bible* s.v. Man of Sin, or *Encyclopædia Britannica* s.v. Antichrist. Besides the homilies mentioned above, Napier XLII also deals with this subject. It is a translation of Adso, *Libellus Antichristi* (v. M. Förster, *Archiv* cxvi. 308), to which has been added a conclusion in Wulfstan's style. In the tenth century references to the end of the world as imminent are common. Continental sources, quoted in B. Thorpe, *Ælfric's Catholic Homilies* I. 621, and in G. G. Coulton, *A Medieval Garner* 4 ff, expressly mention the year 1000 as the date of the end, this view being

georne þæt deofol þas þeode nu fela geara dpelode to spyþe,  
<sup>10</sup> 7 þæt lytle getreopþa pæran mid mannun, þeah hy pel spæcan, 7 unrihta to fela ricode on lande; 7 næs a fela manna þe smeade ymbe þa bote spa georne spa man scolde, ac dæghpamlice man ihte yfel æfter oðrum 7 unriht ræde 7 unlaga manege ealles to pide 7ynd ealle þas þeode.

<sup>8</sup> dpelode: H dpolede.

<sup>9</sup> rixoden; a: C na, H nd.

<sup>10</sup> ræde: H rædde, C aræde.

<sup>11</sup> spæcan: MS spæcan; ricode: H

<sup>12</sup> smeade: C, H hozode, B hozade.

based on a literal interpretation of Revelation xx. 2, 5. In English sources the nearness of the end is mentioned in charters (e.g. BCS 665, dated 929 but of dubious authenticity, BCS 1083, dated 962, KCD 657, dated 987), in the Blickling Homilies X and XI, of which the latter was written in 971, in the *Life of St Neot* (*Anglia* iii. 114), and very frequently in Ælfric's writings (e.g. *Catholic Homilies*, ed. Thorpe, I. 2, 298, 476, 608-18, *Lives of Saints*, ed. W. W. Skeat, I. 304, 352). No precise reference to the year 1000 in this connexion in English records is known, and Wulfstan certainly continued to regard contemporary conditions as a sign of the approaching doom after this year: þusend geara 7 eac ma is nu aȝan . . . 7 Antecristes tima is pel jehende (Napier XIII). Yet Ælfric, in his homily, *In Natale Sanctarum Virginum* (Thorpe, *op.cit.* II. 568), now opposes this opinion: 'Often men say, "Even now comes doomsday" . . . There is no creature who knows the time of this world's ending.' This insistence and Byrhtferth's statement in his *Manual* (ed. S. J. Crawford, EETS, 240) that the thousand years (of Revelation xx. 2) have gone by 'according to human calculation' suggest that there were in England, as abroad, people who had expected the world to end in 1000. See also Bethurum 278-82.

<sup>13</sup> deofol: the use of this word without an article is one of the characteristic features of Wulfstan's style.

<sup>14</sup> fela with the verb in the singular is common in Alfred's writings and in poetry, but rare in Ælfric.

*Sermo Lupi ad Anglos*, ed. Dorothy Whitelock, rev. edn (Exeter: Exeter University Press, 1976)

1997

**I** AM AT THE DOOR  
KNOCKING AT THE DOOR  
FOR MY MEN TO COME

25

(c) Bella Millett describes her approach to editing *Ancrene Wisse* as an attempt 'to address the problems involved in editing a work with a "dynamic" textual tradition'. How far does she succeed in this extract from her EETS edition?

11. 'þi luue,' he seið, 'oðer hit is forte ȝeouen allunge, oðer hit is  
185 to sullen, oðer hit is to reauin ant to neomen wið strengðe. M. 398

12. 'ȝef hit is forte ȝeouen, hwer maht tu biteon hit betere þen  
upo me? Nam Ich þinge feherest? Nam Ich kinge richest? Nam Ich  
hest icunnet? Nam Ich weolie wisest? Nam Ich monne hendest? Nam  
Ich þinge freoest?—for swa me seið bi large mon þe ne con nawt  
190 edhalden, þet he haueð þe honden, as mine beoð, iþurlet. Nam Ich  
alre þinge swotest ant swetest? þus alle þe reisuns hwi me ah to

ȝeoue luue þu maht ifinden in me, nomeliche ȝef þu luuest chaste  
cleannesse; for nan ne mei luue me bute ha hire halde (ah ha is  
þreouald: i widewehad; i spushad; i meidenhad, þe heste).

13. 'ȝef þi luue nis nawt to ȝeouene, ah wult þet me bugge hire— 195  
buggen hire? [Hu?] Oðer wið oðer luue oðer wið sunhwæt elles. Me  
suleð wel luue [for luue]; ant swa me ah to sulle luue, ant for na þing  
elles. ȝef þin is swa to sullen, Ich habbe ihoht hire wið luue ouer alle  
opre, for of þe fowr measte luuen Ich habbe icud toward te þe measte  
of ham alle. 200

#### APPARATUS CRITICUS

177 totweamde] totwinnede GT	182 ȝetten] ȝet NPT
185 to'] forto NP	187 þinge] NT, de toute rien F, omnium rerum L, þing CG, kyng P, homme ke onkes fust S kinge] king CFGP
188 weolie wisest] CGN, peritorum sapientissimus L, de touz le plus sage F, wisest P, li plus sages S, weore wisest T	189 þinge freoest] CGT, le plus franc et le plus larges F, monne ureoest N, hominum liberalissimus L, man freest P, li plus larges hom e li plus franc S
191 swotest ant] om. CPT	192 ifinden] finde PT
193 hire halde] T, trs. CN, holden hem clene P, hire habbe GF, sim. S	193-4 ah ... heste] AL only þe heste] que precellit L
196 buggen hire? Hu?] CFG, buggen hire A, quomodo potest emi L, do seie hwu N, dites coment vus la uolez doner S, hu T	197 for luue] CFGLNPST, om. A
198 after þin] luue NLS	hire] hit CG
	203 schalt seggen] maht

7. 184-5 *þi huue . . . strengðe*: Rouse and Wenzel (1977, p. 651) note that the division is paralleled in *Quoniam* (an English abridgement of William Peraldus's *Summa de vitiis* dating from the third quarter of the thirteenth century), Durham, Cathedral Chapter Library, MS B. I. 18, f. 132<sup>r-v</sup>.

7. 186-92 *3ef . . . in me*: Christ is also presented as having the qualities of an ideal suitor in *HM* 20/5-28, and in *Wohunge* 1-262. The *topos* goes back to

patristic times (see Millett 1982, pp. xliii-xliv), but the passage in *HM* draws on Alan of Lille's late twelfth-century *Summa de arte praedicatoria* (see Millett 1982, p. 49, 20/5-15n), and the lists of qualities in *Wohunge* and *AW* have their closest parallels in thirteenth-century Parisian sermon literature (see Bériou and d'Avray 1994, pp. 31-69); for an exploration of the history of the *topos* and its use in the *AW* Group, see Millett 2008a. See also 7. 188-90n.

7. 188 *weolie wisest*: *weolie* seems to have caused problems in the textual tradition. Tolkien (1962, p. 202) comments, '*weolie*, sic; original word probably *weore* "of men" (as T). L *peritorum* suggests intermediate stage *weote*, *wentie*.' But *weolie* is supported by CGN as well as A, and the variants look like the attempts of individuals to emend a reading they thought corrupt. It is just possible that *weolie wisest* is the author's elliptical fusion of two points in a similar passage in *Wohunge*, ed. Thompson 1958, lines 103-5, 107-9: 'Hwa for largesce is betere wurð to beo luead þen ðu . . . ? Bote largesce is lutel wurð þer wisdom wontes'; cf. also the phrase from Aelfred's *Meditatio* 10 cited by Shepherd 1959, p. 62, 25/4ff.n, *largus sed non prodigus* (PL 158. 762). However, in the list of attributes in *AW* generosity is separately mentioned at a later point ('Nam Ich þinge frecest?' 7. 188-9), which makes this interpretation difficult; the suggestion by Dobson (1974) that *weolie* is to be connected not with OE *welig* 'rich' but with OE \**weolig* 'vily, cunning, wise' (so 'the wisest of wise men') is more likely in context.

7. 188-90 *Nam Ich þinge . . . ipurlet*: Dobson notes that the image is also found in a sermon for Passion Sunday by Stephen Langton (*Nonne solet dici quod manus habet perforatas qui omnia dat et pauca retinet? Hoc etiam modo Dominus manus mistice perforatas habet, quia se ipsum pro nobis donauit . . .*), and in the *Moralia super Evangelia* (*Qui enim dapsilis est, dicitur habere manus perforatas*); it reappears in a 1261 sermon by Robert of Sorbon cited in Bériou and d'Avray 1994, p. 60 (see 7. 186-92n): *Ipsa dat totum . . . Et ultimo, dedit se ipsum in cruce. Vnde habet manus perforatas, ut dicitur de largo*.

7. 193-4 *ah ha . . . heste*: a later addition, found only in AL, probably to make it clear that this advocacy of chastity did not imply a heretical condemnation of marriage (cf. Millett 1982, p. xxxiii, on some similar precautionary qualifications in *HM*).

7. 196 *Hu*: it is likely that *Buggen hire? Hu?* was the reading of the original; the variations in NS can be explained by uneasiness about its elliptical phrasing, which breaks the syntactic thread of the sentence, and the T reading by eyeskip, leading to the omission of the second of two near-identical phrases. It is hard to see why *hu* should have been deliberately dropped in revision, and its retention in L suggests that its omission in A was accidental.

7. 197 *for huue*: in all MSS running but A; the preceding *huue* in A is interrupted by a line-break, which probably encouraged the copyist's eyeskip to the second *huue*.

*Ancrene Wisse: A Corrected Edition of the Text in Cambridge, Corpus Christi College, MS 402, with Variants from Other Manuscripts*, ed. Bella Millett, 2 vols, EETS 325-6 (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005-6)

(d) Comment on the editorial principles and procedure in A.J. Bliss's edition of the opening of *Sir Orfeo*.

2 THE TEXTS OF *SIR ORFEO*  
AUCHINLECK

[SIR ORFEO]

**W**e redeþ oft & findeþ [y-write,] f. 261a  
& þis clerkes wele it wite,  
Layes þat ben in harping  
Ben y-founde of ferli þing:  
Sum beþe of wer & sum of wo, 5  
& sum of ioie & mirþe al-so,  
& sum of trecherie & of gile,  
Of old auentours þat fel while,  
& sum of bourdes & ribaudy,

AUCHINLECK

Mirie time is Auerille: f. 202d  
þan scheweþ michel of our wille.  
In feld & mede floures springeþ,  
In grene wode foules singeþ;  
þong man wexeþ iolif, 5  
& þan proudeþ man & wiif.

HARLEY 3810

We redyn ofte & fynde y-w[ryte,] f. 1a  
As clerkes don vs to wyte,  
The layes that ben of harpyng  
Ben y-founde of frely thing:  
Sum ben of wele, & sum of wo, 5  
& sum of joy & merthe also;  
Sum of bourdys, & sum of rybaudy,  
& sum þer ben of the feyré;  
Sum of trechery, & sum of gyle,  
& sum of happes þat fallen by whyle; 10  
Of alle þing þat men may se  
Moost to lowe, forsoþe, þey be.  
In Brytayne þis layes arne y-wrytt,  
Furst y-founde & forþe y-gete,  
Of adventures þat fallen by dayes, 15  
Wherof Brytouns made her layes.  
When þey myȝt owher heryn  
Of adventures þat þer weryn,



## AUCHINLECK

& mani þer beþ of fairy; 10  
 Of al þinges þat men seþ  
 Mest o loue, for-soþe, þai beþ.  
 ¶ In Breteyne þis layes were wrouȝt,  
 [First y-founde & forþ y-brouȝt,  
 Of auentours þat fel bi dayes, 15  
 Wher-of Bretouns maked her layes.]  
 When kinges miȝt our y-here  
 Of ani meruailes þat þer were,

11 þinges] þingeþ *MS.* 13 *MS* reads In breteyne bi hold time / Þis  
 layes were wrouȝt so seiþ þis rime.

## ASHMOLE 61

Kyng Orfew

f. 151a

**M**ery tyme is in Aperelle,  
 That mekyll schewys of manys wylle.  
 In feldys & medewys flowrys spryng,  
 In grenys & wodys foules syng;  
 Than wex ȝong men jolyffe, 5  
 And þan proudyth man & wyffe.  
 The Brytans, as þe boke seys,  
 Off diuerse thingys þei made þer leys:  
 Som þei made of herpyngys,  
 And som of oper diuerse thingys; 10  
 Som of werre & som off wo,  
 Som of myrthys & joy also;  
 Som of trechery & som off gyle,  
 Som of happys þat felle som-whyle,  
 And som be of rybawdry, 15  
 And many þer ben off fary;  
 Off all þe venturrys men here or se  
 Most off luffe, for-soth, þei be,  
 That in þe leys ben j-wrouȝt,  
 Fyrst fond & forth brouȝt. 20  
 Off auentours þat fell som-deys  
 The Bretonys þer-of made þer leys,  
 Off kyngys þat be-fore vs were;  
 When þei myȝt any woundres here

3 flowrys] flowys *MS.* 6 proudyth] preuyth *MS.*  
 22 Bretonys] brotonys *MS.*

2. Answer ONE of the following:

- a) 'Textual criticism is a science, and, since it comprises recension and emendation, it is also an art. It is the science of discovering error in texts and the art of removing it.' (A.E. HOUSMAN) How complete is this definition of textual criticism?
- b) '[W]e did not stop speaking when we learned to write, nor writing when we learned to print, nor reading, writing or printing when we entered "the electronic age."' (D.F. McKENZIE) What are the implications of this remark for modern editors of medieval English texts?
- c) Discuss how the surviving manuscripts of any ONE OR MORE medieval text(s) provide evidence for changing readership and ownership.
- d) 'Glosynge is a glorious thyng, certeyn.' (CHAUCER, *The Summoner's Tale*) Compare the treatment of manuscript AND/OR editorial glossing in TWO OR MORE medieval texts.
- e) 'The publication process, regardless of its modality, is always a collective process involving numerous actors in which there is no sharp distinction between the materiality of the text and the textuality of the book.' (ROGER CHARTIER)