

DENB 2407

SECOND PUBLIC EXAMINATION

---

HONOUR SCHOOL OF ENGLISH LANGUAGE AND LITERATURE 2010

COURSE II

A4 Introduction to Textual Criticism

---

TRINITY TERM 2010

Thursday, 27 May, 9.15 a.m. – 12.30 p.m.

Time allowed – Three hours plus fifteen minutes reading time

---

Answer BOTH questions 1 and 2.

You may write on the same text in more than one answer, but you should not repeat material. You should pay careful attention in your answers to the precise terms of the quotations and questions.

Do *not* turn over until told to do so

# 1. Choose THREE of (a) to (d)

(a) Provide a comparative appraisal of these extracts from the text and notes of two editions of *Exodus*.

XLII. Hwæt, we feor ond neah gefrigen habbað [p.143  
ofer middangeard Moyses domas,  
wædlico wordriht, wera encorissum –  
in uprodor eadigra gehwam  
5 æfter bealuside bote lifes,  
lifigendra gehwam langsumne ræd –  
hæleðum secgan. Gehyre se þe wille!  
þone on westenne werode Drihten,  
soðfæst Cýning, mid His sylfes miht  
10 gewyrðode, ond him wundra fela  
ece Alwalda in æht forgeaf.  
He was leof Gode, leoda aldor,  
horsc ond hreðergleaw, herges wisa,  
freom folctoga.

## TEXTUAL NOTES

- 1 habbað *Grin*] habað
- 11 forgeaf] a *expuncted and surmounted by point* (to cancel expunction)
- 15 andsacan *Thorpe*] andsaca

## COMMENTARY

1] *Hwæt* is an interjection conventionally used to introduce some OE poems; so also begin *Andreas*, *Beowulf*, and *Juliana*.

1–7] 'a peculiarly elaborate example' of 'the complex type of parallelism' favoured in some OE poems [Gradon, *Form and Style in Early Eng. Lit.* (1971) 157]: *domas*, *wordriht*, *bote*, and *ræd* are all acc. after *secgan*, but *bote* and *ræd* represent distinct aspects of *domas*/*wordriht*. Presumably *domas* and *wordriht* refer to the Pentateuch, which does indeed contain *langsumne ræd*. It also conveys *bote lifes*, but only in so far as the exodus of the Israelites is interpreted as the salvation of mankind. Evidently *bealuside* has a double reference, as SEDGWICK suggested, (1) to the journey of the Israelites through the wilderness to the Promised Land, and (2) to the journey of man through life to the heavenly home. Thus the stylistic device is used to indicate to the audience the kind of response required for the understanding of the poem as a whole. Traherne [*AS Poetry* (1975) 292–3] adduces Ecclus. 45.6 but the OE words do not match those of the Vulgate as closely as he suggests.

1b] MS *habað* is purely scribal; the grammatical form has been restored to avoid the appearance of metrical difficulty.

3] *wordriht* occurs only here and in *Beowulf* 2631 where it probably means 'formal (unwritten) obligation'. Here the reference is to written law. Irving, referring to G. Donahue [*Traditio* vii (1949–51) 263–77 esp. 268 and n.29; see also *idem*, *Traditio* xxi (1965) 55–116 esp. 69–71], seeks to relate the word to Irish *recht litre* 'law of the letter', i.e. ecclesiastical law derived from Scripture, but this is speculation.

6b] *langsumne ræd*: cf. *ece rædas* 516 and note.

6b–7] IRVING compares *Meters of Boethius* 'Proem' 9–10.

7b] Irving 211 compares the biblical admonition 'He that hath ears to hear, let him hear' (Mark 4.9).

8–29] This passage refers primarily to God's appearance in the burning bush to Moses on Mt Horeb (Ex. 3), their first meeting (22b), but other material is also incorporated.

8a] *þone*: Moses.

8b] *werode* is gen. pl. for regular *weroda*.

10] *wundra fela*: specifically the miraculous 'signs' designed to influence Pharaoh, the rod turning into a snake (Ex. 4.3–4) and the diseased hand (4.6–7).

12–14] Moses is described in terms of a Germanic chieftain with the emphasis (esp. in 13a) on his mental rather than his military qualities; cf. Tacitus, *Germania*, ch. xi, 'it is ... their [chiefs'] prestige as counsellors ... that tells'.

P. Lucas edition *Exodus*  
Text and Notes

HWÆT, WĒ FEOR AND NĒAH gefrigen hab[b]að  
 ofer middangeard Moyses dōmas,  
 (wræclīco wordriht wera cnēorissum—  
 in uprodor ēadigra gehwām  
 5 æfter bealusīðe bōte lifes,  
 lifigendra gehwām langsumne rād)  
 hælēðum secgan! Gehyre sē ðe wille!

Done on wēstenne weroda Drihten,  
 sōðfæst Cyning, mid His sylfes miht  
 10 gewyrðode, and him wundra fela,  
 ēce Alwalda, in æht forgeaf.  
 Hē wæs lēof Gode, lēoda aldor,  
 horsc and hreðerglēaw, herges wīsa,  
 freom folctoga.

- 1 Begins p. 143; large ornamental capital *H*  
*hab[b]að*: MS *habað*, so Wlk, Bl, Kr; em. Gr, Klu, Se  
 3 *wræclīco*: *wrætlicu* Bouz, *wrætlicu* Se  
*wordriht*: word dryhtnes Bouz  
 4 *uprodor*: *uproder* (erroneously) Gr, Krm, Klu  
 6 *lifigendra*: *lifgendra* (erroneously) Gr, Krm  
 8 *weroda*: MS *werode*, so Bl; em. Th, Edd  
 11 *forgeaf*: with a dot over and a dot under the *a*; presumably the *a* was deleted and then restored  
 14 *freom*: from Klu

## NOTES

1-7. The general meaning of this introductory passage is fairly clear, but the syntax presents a puzzling problem. A parenthesis of unusual length must be assumed, since *Moyses* is probably to be taken as accusative and subject of the infinitive *secgan*. The whole passage from 3 to 6 represents loosely the message given by Moses; within that passage the phrases may be taken in several ways. *Dōmas*, *wordriht*, *bōte lifes*, and *langsumne rād* seem to be loosely parallel, with the last two representing distinctions or qualifications. The specifically Christian reference here to the future life is worth noticing; obviously there is no such reference to be found in the O.T. version of the laws of Moses. This beginning bears a resemblance to the "Proem" of the *Meters of Boethius*, the closing phrases being almost identical: *folccūðne rād / hælēðum secgan. Hlīste sē þe wille!* (9-10). But the *Meters* show no such grammatical complexity as the passage here. The formula itself was probably a familiar one, descended originally from the minstrel's call for attention.

5. *bealusīðe*. A reference to death, the terrible journey. Sedgefield (n.) suggests that the word refers both to the journey of the Israelites through the wilderness and to man's journey through life. But the contrast of *bealusīðe* with *lifes* in the same line seems deliberate, and *lāðsīð* 44, showing the same metaphor, is to be compared with it.

6. *langsumne rād*. 'Enduring benefit,' the translation offered by Klaeber (*ESL* 41:109). Blackburn (n.), taking this phrase with *hælēðum secgan* in the next line, translates 'a benefit which it would take a long time to tell to men.' But *langsumne rād* is the reward of the living (*lifigendra gehwām*) as opposed to that of the dead; it is part of Moses' legacy, not all of it. Cf. *langsumne hiht* 405.

8-32. This passage describes primarily God's appearance to Moses in the burning bush on Mt. Horeb (Exod. 3), but references to the first meeting (ll. 8-11, 16-18, 22-9) are interspersed with a running survey of Moses' career.

10. *wundra fela*. Specifically, the ability to perform miracles. Cf. Exod. 4:21: "Vide ut omnia ostenta quae posui in manu tua, facias coram Pharaone." (Is *handlān* 19 a reflection of the phrase in *manu tua*?)

(b) Analyse the ways in which the edition and the translation of the *Sermo Lupi* are aimed at different audiences.

7 þurh

þæt þe man spa deð þæt man eal hyrpeð þæt man scolde heregian 7 to forð laðet þæt man scolde lufian, þurh þæt man gebringede ealles to manege on yfelan gepance 7 on 150 undæde, spa þæt hy ne scamað ná, þeh hy syngian spyðe 7 pið Ʒod sylfne forpyrcan hy mid ealle, ac for idelan onscytan hy scamað þæt hy betan heora misdæda spa spa bec tæcan, Ʒelice þam dpæsan þe for heora prytan lepe nellað beorgan ær hy na ne maƷan, þeh hy eal pillan. 165

Her syndan þurh synleapa, spa hit þincan mæƷ, sare Ʒelepede to manege on earde. Her syndan mannsƷagan 7 mæƷsƷagan 7 mæsserbanan 7 mynsterhatan, 7 her syndan mánsporan 7 morþorpyrhtan, 7 her syndan 170 myltestran 7 bearnmyrðran 7 fule forlegene horingas manege, 7 her syndan piccan 7 pælcyrian, 7 her syndan ryperas 7 reaferas 7 porolstruderan, 7, hrædest is to cpeþenne, máná 7 misdæda unƷerim ealra. 7 þæs us ne scamað na, ac us scamað spyþe þæt þe bote aƷinnan spa spa bec tæcan, 7 þæt is Ʒesyne on þysse earman for- 175 synƷodan þeode.

166 þe:

C se; man eal. B eal man, H omits eal.

168 to forð laðet: B to forð laðeð, H for læpeð. 161 hy ne: MS hyne, H heom. 162 hy: H heom; ac: C 7. 163 hy: H heom; heora misdæda; heo first written and re misdæda added in the margin, B glosses it vel synna, H replaces by heoræ synnen; three letters (sæc?) erased after spa spa. 164 prytan lepe: E prytanle pe, C pritan sare, in H prutan appears to have been written, and t altered, perhaps to d. 165 C omits Her syndan . . . forsynƷodan þeode (l. 176), B and H from the same place to ealles to lanƷe (l. 180).

167 After syndan E adds spa pe ær sædon. 168 mæsserbanan: E sacerdbanan; after mynsterhatan E adds 7 hlaforðspican 7 Ʒebere apostatan. 169 After morþorpyrhtan E adds 7 her syndan hædbrecan 7 æpbrecan 7 ðurh sibleru 7 ðurh mistlice forligeru forsynƷode spyðe. 170 r of myltestran added above. 171 A letter erased after manege; pælcyrian: e erased after c, E pælcerian.

172 After porolstruderan E adds 7 ðeofas 7 þeodscaban 7 pedloƷan 7 pærloƷan. 174 After ac E adds þæs; aƷinnan corrected from aƷunnan.

166 laðet: this has often been mistaken for the 3rd pers. pres.indic. of lāðian, though BT places it correctly under lāþettan. It is shown to be the true reading by the form lāþette of XXXIV, which has borrowed the whole passage, but turned it into the past tense.

164 bec: i.e. the penitential books in use in the Anglo-Saxon Church, on which v. T. P. Oakley, *English Penitential Discipline*, especially ch. 5, and the literature there cited. For OE penitentials of the tenth century, mainly translated from Frankish sources, v. J. Raith, *Die altenglische Version des Hilgar'schen Bussbuches* (i.e. the Penitential of Pseudo-Ecgbert), and R. Spindler, *Das altenglische Bussbuch* (i.e. the Confessional of Pseudo-Ecgbert).

prytan lepe: the MS variants here are due to the unfamiliarity of the word lepe. Both it and synleap are not on record elsewhere, though the compound limlæp occurs in penitential literature; cf also limlæpeo (for limlæpeð), EGu 10. As McIntosh suggests, lepe is the direct object of beorgan. He translates (*Proc. Brit. Acad.* xxxv. 139) 'are prevented by their pride from curing their spiritual infirmities'. I would prefer to omit 'spiritual', for Wulfstan is comparing people who will not undergo penance with those who will not seek healing for their bodily infirmities until it is too late.

166-73 Her syndan þurh synleapa . . . unƷerim ealra: this list, which is in I and E only, is akin to many lists of criminals scattered through Wulfstan's works. Dr Bethurum (p. 310) suggests that the first form of it is the list freely translated from Amalarius's *De regula canoniorum* (Xa in her edition, ll. 11-14). Longer lists than this occur in Napier III, XXII (which, like our *sermo*, includes bearnmyrðran) and

L, the first twelve names in which begin a list added to the non-Wulfstan homily LVII, though each list continues differently, L including þeodscaban, pedloƷan and pærloƷan, which are in the E text of our *sermo*, while LVII has pyccan 7 pælcyrian as in our *sermo* and Cnut's letter of 1019/1020. A similar list has also been added to a translation of Adso in XLII. In the laws drafted by Wulfstan, shorter lists are found, in EGu 11 (repeated in VI Atr 7, with an addition, and in II Cn 4a-4.2) and II Cn 6 and 7. The list in Cnut's letter is probably borrowed from our *sermo*. Otherwise all lists have individual features, and it is likely that Wulfstan wrote this type of thing from memory. It should be noted that E expands the list given in I with several items occurring in other works, e.g. hlaforðspican is in L, LVII and XLII, sacerdbanan and hædbrecan in L and LVII.

167 Ʒelepede: this word, which occurs also in XVI, and the Ʒelepied in Ælfric (S. J. Crawford, *Heptateuch* 268), which renders debilitatum, are better taken as p.pt. of a derivative verb from læp 'blemish' than as from læpan 'to betray'.

169 morþorpyrhtan: v. Bethurum 310; morþ refers particularly to secret methods of slaying, such as by poison or witchcraft. Dr Bethurum notes the translation of morþeorcum as ueneficia in the Latin version of VI Atr 28.3.

170 bearnmyrðran: Professor Dickins has suggested that the Scandinavian custom of exposing infants may be included in this condemnation; for this see Margaret Schlauch, *Romance in Iceland* 96.

171 piccan 7 pælcyrian: except in Napier LVII and the Cnut letter (v. note to ll. 166-73), this phrase is not otherwise recorded in OE, but it appears as wychez and walkyries in the fourteenth-century alliterative poem, *Purity*, l. 1577 (v. BT s.v. wælcyrge). Pælcyrie is used to gloss classical names (i.e. of the Furies, a Gorgon, Bellona and once Venus) first in the eighth-century Corpus Glossary and commonly in the tenth and eleventh centuries (cf ON valkyrja, on which see Snorra Edda, *Gylfaginning* c. 36, tr. A. G. Brodeur).

Wulfstan presumably means by it some kind of witch, though the glosses show that it could refer to a supernatural being. The OE pælceazeƷa 'chooser of the slain' occurs in the poem *Exodus*, l. 164, but is applied to a bird of carrion.

References to witchcraft are common in church laws and penitentials, and occur also in X and in Ælfric's *De Auguriis* (*Lives of Saints*, ed. W. W. Skeat I. XVII, ll. 110 ff). The most interesting example of belief in witchcraft is in a charter (BCS 1131 = Robertson XXXVII), which mentions the outlawry of a man and the drowning of a woman for an offence that comes under this heading (cf II As 6).

## D. Whitelock edition *Sermo Lupi*

And because they behave thus  
— that they blame all that they should praise, and hate too much  
what they should love — they bring all too many evil intentions  
and wicked deeds, so that they are not ashamed although they  
sin greatly and commit wrongs even against God himself. But  
because of idle calumny, they are ashamed to atone for their  
misdeeds as the books direct,<sup>1</sup> like those fools who because of  
their pride will not guard against injury, until they cannot even  
though they wish to.

Here, so it seems, too many in the land are grievously hurt with  
the injuries of sin. Here are slayers of men and slayers of kinsmen  
and killers of priests and enemies of the monasteries; and here are  
perjurers and murderers; and here are whores and those who kill  
children and many foul fornicating adulterers; and here are  
wizards and witches;<sup>2</sup> and here are plunderers and robbers and  
those who despoil; and, to be brief, countless numbers of all  
crimes and misdeeds. And we are not ashamed of it; but we are  
too ashamed to begin reparation as the books direct; and that is  
clear in this wretched nation, burdened with sin.

<sup>1</sup> Formal penitential lists compiled by the Church.

<sup>2</sup> Wulfstan uses the word *wælcyrie*, borrowed from the Viking word *valkyrja*, 'chooser of the slain'; for belief in this aspect of witchcraft, see p. 35.

(c) Assess the effectiveness of this extract from Dobson's diplomatic edition of *Ancrene Wisse* in conveying the scribal complexities of the Cleopatra manuscript.

(M. 384) <sup>her biginneð þe seouede dale of lu ue<sup>7</sup></sup> **S**einte<sup>6</sup> pawel witneð þ̅ alle uttre hard schipes. alle flesch pinsunges. licomliche swinkes al is ase naut aþeines luue þeschireð & brichteð þe heorte.<sup>8</sup> exercicio<sup>9</sup> cor por[is]<sup>10</sup> admodicum ualet<sup>11</sup>. Pietas<sup>12</sup> autem ualet ad omnia þ̅ is licomliche bisischepe isto lutel wurð ach swote & schir heorte is god to alle þinges Si linguis<sup>13</sup> hominum loquar & angelorum. Infra. sitradidero<sup>14</sup> corpus meum ita ut ardeam. Infra. Si distribuero omnes facultates incibos pauperum<sup>15</sup> caritatem autem non habeam.<sup>16</sup> nichil michi prodest. þach ich cuðe he seið menne<sup>17</sup> ledene<sup>18</sup> & a<sup>19</sup> engle[ne]<sup>20</sup>. þach ich dude on min bodi alpe pine & Passiun. þ̅ bodi muchte þolien. þach ich þeue po ure al þ̅ ich hefde. þef ich nesde<sup>21</sup> luue  
f. 179 þer wið to god & to alle men in him & for him al were ispillid. for as þe hali abbed moyses seide. al þe wa & al þe hard þ̅ we þolieð on fles & alpe god þ̅ wedoð. alle swiche þinges ne beoð bute leomen<sup>1</sup> to tilie wið þe heorte þef þeaxe necurue. ne spitel stef ne dulue ne þe sulch ne erede. hwa kepte ham to halden. Aswa as namon ne luueð leomen<sup>1</sup> for ham seolf ach deð for þe þinges þ̅ me wurcheð wið ham. aswa nan flesches derf nis to luue bute for þi. þ̅ god þe raðere þiderwart lokeð<sup>2</sup> mid his grace & makeð<sup>3</sup> þe he orte schir & of bricht sichðe. þ̅ nan nemei habbe wið monglung of un þeawes ne wið eorðlich luue of worldlich þinges. for þis mong weorreð swa þe echnen of þe he orte þ̅ ha ne mei icnawen god ne g<1>adien<sup>4</sup> of sichðes.

<sup>1</sup> D adds 'after word'. <sup>4</sup> D adds vertical marks, to separate words, above and below line after u. <sup>5</sup> Abbreviated *mað*. <sup>6</sup> Two-line blue initial, flourished in red. In left margin, extending almost to fourth line below, D writes in ink: *In hac .7<sup>a</sup>. parte agitur de amore ubitur [sic] ostenditur quod omnia dura que tolerantur in carne vel etiam bona elemosine data non equipollent amoris clari fiant cor humanum.* <sup>7</sup> In A's hand, in plummet, in right-hand margin; intended (as elsewhere) as guide to himself acting as rubricator, but he has failed to ink in his draft. <sup>8</sup> D adds paragraph-mark slightly to right of A's point.

<sup>9</sup> Above line, extending into right margin, D writes *thimo*. *4.d.* preceded by vertical stroke, possibly a miscopying of the numeral *x*. <sup>10</sup> D has erased top of final long *s* and converted the *i* and what remains of the *s* into *a*; above, he writes *i* to make *corporalis* (as Vulgate). <sup>11</sup> D strikes through *ualet* and writes *utilis est* above (as Vulgate). <sup>12</sup> Large black capital *P*. <sup>13</sup> D writes *corinth. 13.* above. <sup>14</sup> D writes *eodem* above. <sup>15</sup> Second *p* (part of abbreviation for *per*) formed at foot like *wynn*. <sup>16</sup> D erases part of A's *:* in attempt to distinguish it from usual form of medieval question-mark. He also retouches the initial *h* and the abbreviation-mark of the preceding *habeam*. <sup>17</sup> D adds *s* above final *e* to make *menne*. <sup>18</sup> D writes gloss *speche* above. <sup>19</sup> Sub-puncted by A himself; perhaps he had begun to write the French form of 'angel'.

<sup>20</sup> D erases final *ne* except for first minim of *n*, which he converts into long *s*. <sup>21</sup> So MS., with long *s*, for *nefde*; cross-stroke of *f* omitted.

f. 179 <sup>1</sup> So MS., for *lomen* 'tools'.



<sup>2</sup> So MS., for *lomen* 'tools'. <sup>3</sup> Abbreviated *loð*. <sup>4</sup> Abbreviated *mað*. <sup>5</sup> A himself writes *l* above line and marks it for insertion after *g*. <sup>6</sup> The word *his* is omitted before *sichðe*.

E.J. Dobson edition *The English Text of the Ancrene Riwe edited from B.M Cotton Cleopatra C. vi*



(d) Comment on the ways in which these two extracts from different manuscripts of *Sir Orfeo* provide us with an insight into the text's transmission.

'Parfay!' quap he 'icham a minstrel, lo!  
To solas þi lord wip mi gle,  
Šif his swete wille be.'  
3850 þe porter vndede þe Šate anon  
& lete him into þe castel gon.  
þan he gan bihold about al  
& seiŠe ful liggeand wipin þe wal  
Of folk þat were þider ybrouŠt  
3900 & þouŠt dede, & nare nouŠt.

Sum stode wipouten hade {f.302ra}   
& sum non armes nade  
& sum þurth þe bodi hadde wounde  
& sum lay wode, ybounde,  
3950 & sum armed on hors sete  
& sum astrangled as þai ete  
& sum were in water adreynt  
& sum wip fire al forschreynt;  
Wiues þer lay on childbedde,  
4000 Sum ded, & sum awedde;  
& wonder fele þer lay bisides  
RiŠt as þai slepe her vndertides.  
Eche was þus in þis world ynome,  
Wip fairi þider ycome.  
4050 þer he seiŠe his owen wiif,  
Dame Heurodis, his lef liif, 

*lef: MS reads liif.*

Slepe vnder an ympe-tre,  
Bi her clopes he knewe þat it was he.  
¶ & when he hadde bihold þis meruails alle  
4100 He went into þe kinges halle.  
þan seiŠe he þer a semly siŠt,  
A tabernacle blisseful & briŠt,  
þerin her maister king sete  
& her quen fair & swete.  
4150 Her crounes, her clopes, schine so briŠt  
þat vnneþe bihold he hem miŠt.

D. Burnley and A. Wiggins edition *The Auchinleck Manuscript*  
<http://www.nls.uk/auchinleck>



'Parfay! Y am a mynstrel, lol  
 To solas þe *with* my gle  
 — þe merier schalt þou be.'  
 He vnded þe gate anone  
 & lete hym in-to þe castel gone. 370  
 Orpheo loked about ouer-all;  
 He sawe folk sit vnder þe wal,  
 Sum þat wer þyder y-brouȝt  
 — Al dede were þey nouȝt.  
 Amonge hem lay his owne wyfe, 375  
 þat he loued as his lyfe.  
 Sche lay vnder an ympe-tre:  
 By her glowes he wyst it was sche.  
 He went forþe in-to þe halle;  
 Þerin was grete joy *with*-alle. 380  
 The ryche kyng þerin sete: f. 8a  
 He fyl on knees & hym grette.  
 By hym sete a quen bryȝt  
 — Vnnepis he had of hur a syȝt.

Harley 3810 *Sir Orfeo* from A.J Bliss edition

**2. Answer ONE of the following. You may answer these questions with reference to any one or two of the set texts.**

(a) 'Even though in historical terms [...] a vernacular Middle English author is an impossibility, post-romantic conceptions of authorship and the authoritative text have been readily adapted in the editing of many medieval texts.' (T.W. Machan). Discuss.

(b) 'It is vitally important that we edit and read medieval texts with an awareness of their manuscript context'. Do you agree?

(c) 'The manuscript the editor must reject is always the most interesting.' (Derek Pearsall). Have you found this to be the case?

(d) Electronic editions of Old and Middle English texts recreate in part 'the reading experience of those who first consulted the manuscripts [...] in which the work was recorded.' (Julia Boffey). Do they?

(e) By what means can modern editions represent most effectively the processes of manuscript transmission?