

DFA counter proposal to the Dunbar Harbour Development plan

For the avoidance of doubt, the Dunbar Fishermen's Association supports the aims to make the harbour accessible 24/7, bring the lifeboat back plus increase DHT income. However, we think Dunbar Harbour Developments Ltd's plan is fundamentally flawed and we now counter propose an approach that will deliver results at a fraction of the cost:

1. Based on a consensus of fishermen's experience we do not think the proposed breakwater will prevent the surge in all tide and weather conditions as promised. The prevailing wind conditions are westerly (not northerly, as DHD's consultants have based their findings on) so the breakwater may actually make matters worse by funnelling the surge into the harbour. The Cromwell harbour is the only safe option in bad weather and to get the desired result, instead of the breakwater simply put dolos's (e.g. as used at Torness power station) just outside the harbour entrance plus lock gates across the entrance to Broadhaven.
2. With the breakwater idea redundant, the proposed roadway, new bridges etc are another unnecessary expense. Additionally, it would be more efficient and cheaper to bring in the materials needed to repair the walls etc by barge, which would also avoid the health and safety risks associated with bringing around 4,000 HGV lorries down Victoria Place.
3. Simply lowering the bar at the harbour entrance may allow the harbour to be self-flushing as there would no longer be a barrier holding the sand in. Using the FLAG money for the intended purpose of dredging will provide all tide access and get us the lifeboat back.
4. There is nothing at all in DHD's plans about the Cromwell harbour, yet it's wall is in as critical condition as the Victoria harbour north wall.
5. There is nothing at all in DHD's plans about developing the fishing industry, the contributor of the majority of harbour revenues. Instead of harming the fishing industry by not allowing any development until the Mainstream decision is made, fishing should be central to the economic development plans.

	Skipper	Experience	Signature
1	John Fairgrieve	47	<i>John Fairgrieve</i>
2	John Bisset	34	<i>John Bisset</i>
3	David Kittrick	40	<i>David Kittrick</i>
4	Neil Brunton	21	<i>Neil Brunton</i>
5	Thomas Welsh	8	<i>Thomas Welsh</i>
6	Douglas Easingwood	retired	
7	Barry Brunton	11	
8	Alastair Lugton	2	<i>A. Lugton</i>
9	Kevin Keillor	15	<i>K. Keillor</i>
10	Eddie McFarlane	35	<i>E. McFarlane</i>
11	Davy Lees	58	<i>D. Lees</i>
12	Callum Thomson	5	<i>Callum Thomson</i>
13	Bob Davis	sold boat	
14	Robert Davis	55	<i>Robert Davis</i>
15	Douglas Easingwood	42	<i>D. Easingwood</i>
16	Angus Wight	42	<i>A. Wight</i>
17	Peter Johnstone	48	<i>Peter Johnstone</i>
18	Peter Brunton	35	<i>Peter Brunton</i>
19	Richard Bisset	30	<i>R. Bisset</i>
20	Eddie Johnstone (snr)	50	<i>E. Johnstone</i>
21	Eddie Johnstone	29	<i>E. Johnstone</i>
22	James Bisset	35	<i>J. Bisset</i>
23	Noel Wight	50	<i>Noel Wight</i>
		681	total years