

Information Policy & Compliance bbc.co.uk/foi

Alan Cox

8 February 2010

Dear Alan,

# Freedom of Information Act 2000 - RFI20100039

Thank you for your request under the Freedom of Information Act ('the Act') of 11 January 2010, seeking:

- "[1.] A list of the organisations that indicated to the BBC an interest in DTG D-Book copy protection.
- [2.] A list of the content providing and receiver hardware/software producers the BBC held discussions with on this matter.
- [3.] A list of standards bodies (such as the DTLA) whom the BBC held discussions with.
- [4.] The missing public interest test analysis (the final summary for management is sufficient), or confirmation that one was not performed."

In your request, you noted that that you were "**not** requesting any minutes of or copies of any emails/meetings, merely the names of the bodies... The names are sufficient for the moment." You also noted that your request excluded "any informal contacts with content and receiver organisations" but should be restricted to only those organisations with whom "[BBC] management specifically decided to hold discussions or meetings with at a formal level".



#### Requested item I

As disclosed in response to requested items 2 and 3 below, the BBC has had many contacts with content providers and hardware manufacturers. In releasing the information below, the BBC has interpreted the request as widely as possible.

However, in respect of this requested item, we believe that we do not hold the information that you are seeking. In discussion with content providers, we have not discussed their 'interest' per se in 'DTG D-Book copy protection', but rather the protection of their copyright and other rights in general. Similarly, in discussion with hardware and software manufacturers who are producing equipment intending to be compliant with the D Book, we have not discussed an 'interest' in the specific copy protection technology, rather their general compliance with the guidelines set out in the D Book.

We are aware that members of our staff have been present at meetings of the DVB Project at which content management technologies have been discussed, and appreciate that there may have been conversations or discussions held with those who may have expressed a detailed, technical 'interest' in the system which is ultimately set out in the D Book. Whilst we consider these to have been the sort of 'informal contacts' which you have excluded from your request, we can confirm nevertheless that we do not hold information which would allow us to identify these discussions or the organisations involved.

#### Requested item 2

The BBC does not hold any specific information in relation to discussions with content providers as regards the DTG D-Book copy protection system for Freeview HD. However, and outside the scope of your request, we are prepared to disclose the names of those content providing organisations with whom we have discussed copy protection in general as part of their supply agreements. The names of these organisations are attached as appendix I to this letter.

In respect of hardware and software manufacturers, we have held discussions concerning, amongst other things, the copy protection system set out in the D Book in two ways. The first way is through the meetings of the DTG and its sub-groups, in many of which we have involvement and some of which members of our staff chair. The second is through bi-lateral discussions with certain equipment manufacturers and suppliers.

It is important to note that the DTG D Book is a vast document which covers many topics; indeed, the document is intended to be as comprehensive as possible to encourage interoperability between devices. As the DTG meetings are conducted on a wide scale and generally concerning the sections of the document wider than just the copy protection system for Freeview HD, we consider that we do not hold sufficient information to correlate meeting attendance with the matters which were discussed at each meeting.

This notwithstanding, we consider that much of the discussion about any copy protection system is likely to have occurred at meetings of four specific DTG groups: the Receiver Recommendations Group, the SI Group, the T2 Launch Group, and the Technical Council. The terms of reference and membership of these groups is a matter for the Digital Television Group, who are not subject to the Act. However, we note that full details of the DTG's membership are available online at:

### http://www.dtg.org.uk/dtg/members.html

In respect of bi-lateral meetings between the BBC and receiver hardware and software manufacturers, we can confirm that discussions relating to the DTG D-Book copy protection system have taken place with all of the parties listed in appendix 2

The BBC has communicated extensively and directly with a wider group of hardware and software manufacturers in relation to the development of the Freeview HD standard. These communications have included bi-lateral face to face meetings, some of which will have addressed issues relating of the copy protection system. Unfortunately, we do not hold sufficient information to determine whether or not, or at which meetings, the copy management system in the D Book was discussed with each of these manufacturers. Nevertheless, we have attached a list of those organisations with whom we have had bi-lateral engagement over the development of Freeview HD in the widest sense as appendix 3 to this letter.

# Requested item 3

We attach a list of those standards bodies (which we have interpreted in the widest sense – that is to include the DTLA, who are not themselves a standards body) with whom we have held discussions as appendix 4 to this letter.

#### Requested item 4

I am able to confirm that there has not been a 'public value test' in the sense given to it by the BBC Agreement in relation to the copy protection technologies which are proposed to be used for Freeview HD. The BBC has however made an assessment of the merits of the proposed copy protection technology, which has been recently published as part of Ofcom's consultation document on the subject. This is available as part of the document published at this location:

http://www.ofcom.org.uk/consult/condocs/content mngt/condoc.pdf

# **Appeal Rights**

If you are not satisfied with this response you have the right to an internal review by a BBC senior manager or legal adviser. Please contact us at the address below, explaining what you would like us to review and including your reference number. If you are not satisfied with the internal review,

you can appeal to the Information Commissioner. The contact details are: Information Commissioner's Office, Wycliffe House, Water Lane, Wilmslow, Cheshire, SK9 5AF, telephone 01625 545 700 or see <a href="http://www.ico.gov.uk/">http://www.ico.gov.uk/</a>

Yours sincerely,

Graham Plumb
Acting Controller
BBC Distribution

#### **APPENDIX I - CONTENT PROVIDERS**

- ITV
- C4
- S4C
- Five
- BBC Worldwide
- Disney
- Fox Entertainment
- Sony Pictures
- Time Warner

# APPENDIX 2 - HARDWARE/SOFTWARE MANUFACTURERS - BI-LATERAL ENGAGEMENT ON SPECIFICS OF D BOOK COPY PROTECTION SYSTEM

- Cabot
- Humax
- LG
- Pace
- Panasonic
- Philips
- Samsung
- Sony
- Sony Semiconductor
- Tvonics
- Vestel

# APPENDIX 3 - HARDWARE/SOFTWARE MANUFACTURERS - BI-LATERAL ENGAGEMENT ON ASPECTS OF THE DEVELOPMENT OF FREEVIEW HD PRODUCTS

- ADB Global
- Argos
- Arqiva
- Bristol Interactive TV
- Broadcom
- Cabot
- Cisco
- Digital Stream Technology
- Digitalvision TV
- DMOL
- Dixons Stores Group (DSG)
- Digital TV Labs

- Echostar
- Fujitsu
- Hitachi
- Homecast
- Humax
- IPVision
- JVC
- Kaon Media
- LG
- Loewe
- Metronic
- Microsoft
- Mstar
- NEC
- NXP
- Pace
- Panasonic
- Philips
- Pixsan
- Simply Media/3View
- S&T
- Sagem
- Sainsburys
- Samsung
- Sharp
- Sidsa
- Siemens
- Silicon Labs
- Sony
- Sony Semiconductor
- ST Microelectronics
- Teamcast
- Thomson
- TopUp TV
- Toshiba
- Tvonics
- Vestel

# **APPENDIX 4 - STANDARDS BODIES**

- Digital Transmission Licensing Administrator (DTLA)
- Digital Video Broadcasting (DVB) project particularly project groups DVB-CPT and DVB-GBS
- Digital Television Group
- European Broadcasting Union (EBU)
- Marlin Developer Community (MDC) / Marlin Partner Program (MPP) / Marlin Trust Management Organisation (MTMO)